



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes June 26, 2019

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Don Cosper, Creig Hoskins, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe, Chris Swain
Members Absent: Sam Frazier, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Sheila Montgomery-Mills,
Staff Present: Karla Calvert, John Sims, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters
Others Present: David Smithey, Dan Fields, Savannah Holt, Randy Britton, Hudson Hattl, Willie Martin, Louis Willie, Robert Ecking, Libby Rich, Liz Clark, Charles Jordan, Josh Muckelvaney, Charlie Logan, Jared Fulton, Gary Hull, Joshua Williams, Joey McClure, Rob Buddo, Donna Whittoch, Hunter Finch, Lisa McClure, Wes Danley, Howard Richards, Willie Oliver

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Mr. Don Cosper. He stated that the minutes of the June 12, 2019 meeting were not ready for the committee to review.

- I. Name:** Mr. Mark Coyle
Site Address: 716 30th Street S (Former LBYD Office)
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Painting (Color change)

Statements: Mr. Charley Logan is proposing to change the exterior colors (Field Color SW 6348 Reynard; Accent Color 01 SW 7019 Gauntlet Gray; Accent Color 02 SW 7069 Iron Ore) that were approved by the committee at the October 25, 2018 DRC meeting. The new colors are SW Repose Gray for the base color and SW 7019 Gauntlet Gray for the trim and roof. Mr. Logan is asking for forgiveness.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Mr. Hunter Finch
Site Address: 2839 7th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Review Exterior Repairs



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes June 26, 2019

Statements: Mr. Hunter Finch was asked to come in to let the committee know the proposed repairs to the exterior. He is proposing to remove the existing unpainted wood and replace it with new painted wood. Cosper stated that Mr. Finch would need to bring back details of the repairs, and bring a plan for the mortar joints.

Motion: None

Motion seconded by: N/A

Discussion: None

Vote: No vote.

III. Name: Mr. Wes Daniel (Daniel Signs, Inc.)

Site Address: 2839 7th Avenue S.

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Sims stated that the applicant is requesting that the committee give comments. Mr. Wes Daniel presented two proposals. The committee suggested that the applicant place two signs on each exterior elevation and possibly locate one sign over the entrance door.

Motion: None

Motion seconded by: N/A

Discussion: Ms. Libby Rich stated that this is such a historic and beautiful building, and she encouraged the applicant to be very careful not to destroy the character of this building with a sign that is not respectful.

Vote: No vote.

IV. Name: Mr. Dave Smithey

Site Address: 3254 Highland Drive

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing selected wood windows and wood doors

Statements: Cosper asked if there was a report from the Highland Park Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the Advisory Committee recommended to approve the proposal as presented. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to approve the design review request for the following reasons: The replacement windows match the existing window mullions, sash, stile and rail width, muntin pattern, etc. Where windows not original to the house are to be removed, the replacement windows are in keeping with the architectural character of the house. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: D. Windows (Page 10)—New units shall match the originals as closely as possible in appearance. The Local Historic Advisory Committee Standard of Review Findings of Fact were as follows: (1) The proposed change, erection, or demolition conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change, erection, or demolition is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed erection, alteration,



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes June 26, 2019

restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource; and (4) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

V. Name: Mr. Willie Martin (W&M Contractor)

Site Address: 1636 31st Street North

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing siding over the entire house

Statements: Perry stated that the Norwood Local Historic Advisory Committee recommended to approve the proposal as presented. The Advisory Committee was to approved the design review request for the following reasons: In accordance with Page 15-Item K-Materials, the proposed #105 wood siding is appropriate to the character of the house and is approved as an alternative to the original lap siding. In accordance with Page 16-Item L-Paint, the proposed colors are compatible with the age and style of the house. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: Page 15-Item K-Materials; and Page 16-Item L-Paint. The Local Historic Advisory Committee Standard of Review Findings of Fact were as follows: (1) The proposed change, erection, or demolition conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change, erection, or demolition is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource; and (4) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: Wolfe asked Mr. Martin if he was removing all of the siding. Mr. Martin answered yes that the faux brick would be removed and the #105 wood siding would be applied. Hoskins and Wolfe questioned the location of paint colors. Mr. Martin explained where all trim colors would be placed. He stated that the window trim board would be painted yellow, and the siding and windows would be painted white.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VI. Name: Mr. Randy Britton

Site Address: 212 through 218 20th Street North



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes June 26, 2019

District: Birmingham Green

Requesting approval for: Handicap Ramp

Statements: This case was last heard at the June 12, 2019 DRC meeting. At that time the proposal failed by a vote of 4 to 4. At today's meeting, Mr. Britton presented a site plan and the details requested by the Committee at the last meeting. He showed plans for a 5' wide stoop and a 4' wide ramp.

Motion: Hoskins moved to approve the proposal subject to the applicant receiving a right-of-way agreement and removing the black paint from the limestone.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: Mr. Louis Willie (Attorney) stated that he is representing the nearby property owners. He said that the ramp is a creature of the designer's own doing. He said that there are significant concerns about the use of the alley impeding the nearby property owners from accessing their garage and impeding emergency vehicles from serving the residents. Sims stated that the right-of-way agreement would be under the engineering division's purview, and not that of the DRC.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VII. Name: Mr. Jared Fulton

Site Address: 4405 6th Avenue South

District: Avondale Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Repairing steps and post support; replacing support of existing entrance; and adding pavers to the front yard and a sitting area.

Statements: Perry stated that the recommendation of the Avondale Local Historic Advisory Committee was to approve with conditions the design review request for the following reasons: "Applicant agreed to add a second identical porch support post. The post will be installed to the left of the existing post (looking at the house from the street). All other aspects of the case were approved as presented." The Advisory Committee determined that the applicant's design is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood. The Local Historic Advisory Committee Standard of Review Findings of Fact were as follows: (1) The proposed change, erection, or demolition conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change, erection, or demolition is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource; and (4) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the district.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the proposal with the conditions noted by the Advisory Committee

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: None



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
June 26, 2019

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII. Name: Mr. Joshua G. Willens (JG Willens Building LLC)

Site Address: 1022 28th Place South

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Repairing damaged rotted wood on porch; repairing existing column; re-painting porch to match existing color; and replacing porch roof

Statements: Perry stated that the Highland Park Local Historic Advisory Committee recommended to approve the proposal with conditions. The conditions placed on the request were as follows: “(1) The owner may at his discretion, paint with house-standard trim color or stain portion of the front door, sidelite and transom unit at this discretion in whole or in part, provided that individual elements (door sash, sidelites, panels beneath sidelites, transom window, and mullions & time) are treated consistently in the composition of the entry unit; 2) Owner will mulch from the front of the house to the sidewalk at the completion of construction. 3) Owner was encouraged, but not required, to paint the upper soffit during the course of this work.” The Advisory Committee recommended to approve with conditions the design review request for the following reason: The proposed work complies with the design guidelines. The recommendation was based on the followings sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines: General Standard for Review #5; Section B “Porches”; Section C “Doors”; and Section D “Windows.” The Local Historic Advisory Committee Standard of Review Findings of Fact were as follows: (1) The proposed change, erection, or demolition conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change, erection, or demolition is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource; and (4) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IX. Name: Mr. Willie Oliver

Site Address: 118 Oporto Madrid Blvd. (Casa de paz / House of Peace)

District: East Lake

Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Ms. Dayana Pena and one of the owners of the subject property first introduced and presented this project at the May 8, 2019 DRC meeting. At that presentation, Macknally made a motion to table the project due to the lack of scaled drawings and a landscape plan of the proposed modifications. Ms. Pena proceeded to retain the services of an architect, Mr. Willie Oliver. Mr. Oliver came forward to present his scheme to revamp the building’s



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes June 26, 2019

exterior elements and landscape. Wolfe updated Mr. Oliver of what the committee asked for during the previous presentation, highlighting the access points into the building as some of the main concerns. Mr. Oliver indicated that his survey of the building revealed a lot more problem areas especially with the interior conditions. Wolfe pointed out that the previous proposal called for sealing the three front windows while Mr. Oliver's proposal retained the windows in addition to providing awnings. Mr. Oliver stated that the rear access would include a wheelchair ramp constructed with pressure treated wood members. Wolfe asked about a side door and what appeared to be a makeshift ramp to which Mr. Oliver responded that it was a means of moving furniture in and out of the facility. Mr. Oliver said he advised the owners to add railings to the loading ramp. Wolfe asked about the color and in response, Ms. Pena said they plan on painting the walls white and upon further inquiry, she said the awning would also be painted white. Hoskins stated that Ms. Pena may want to reconsider the awning color. Wieseman asked about the color of the roof, and Mr. Oliver said it is charcoal-grey. Hoskins suggested that Mr. Oliver should consider charcoal-grey or a dark color for the awnings and masonry at the base of the wall. He told Mr. Oliver to send the color samples to staff member John Sims for final review.

On July 1, 2019, Ms. Pena sent images of the proposed colors to staff member Tonte Peters. The chosen colors were grey (MI 12) for the main walls and dark grey (TR 05) for the masonry wall base and the awnings. Mr. Peters responded to Ms. Pena's email approving the colors.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the project, with colors to be presented to staff.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

X. **Name:** Mr. Dan Fritts

Site Address: 1329 4th Avenue South

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. Fritts is proposing to renovate an existing three-story building located at 1329 4th Avenue South. He is converting the upper floors into one and two bedroom condo units with one level added on top of the existing structure. He is demolishing the existing one story attached garage to construct new ground level parking with a second level courtyard and two additional levels of one and two bedroom condo units. The exterior material will be as follows: Painted brick, corten steel panels, hardi board lap siding, new operable windows, new painted steel rail, store front, garage doors, and new fixed windows. There will be 35 condos. Mr. Fritts said he would return with signage.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
June 26, 2019

- XI. Name:** Mr. Creig Hoskins
Site Address: 4802 and 4812 Avenue West
District: Five Points West
Requesting approval for: New Construction

Statements: Mr. Hoskins is recusing himself. He stated that Mr. Charles Jordan will present the BJCTA Birmingham Xpress BRT project, West Terminus Station. He said they are designing a transfer facility in the Five Points West area of Birmingham to comply with Federal Transit Administration (FTA) regulations. The building is orientated on the site with Five Points West Library, the BRT raised platform walk-through station located on the Avenue W side of building. Also on the Avenue W side are two plazas with a landscaped focal plaza. One of the plazas will include a potential public art location. The building materials will be Aluminum Composite and metal Rainscreen Panels, Glazed Aluminum Storefront. The signage will be 36” and 18” high white cast aluminum.

Motion: Swain made a motion to approve the proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously, with Hoskins recusing himself.

- XII. Name:** Mr. David Brandt
Site Address: 1904 1st Avenue North
District: 19th Street
Requesting approval for: Signage Master Plan

Statements: This case was last heard at the June 12, 2019 DRC meeting. The committee moved to carry over this proposal to allow the applicant to show the proposal to align the Tenant 1 sign over the windows and to bring back a proposal for the 7’ projecting sign Tenant 2 sign.

At today’s meeting Mr. Brandt presented a Signage Master Plan for the Coyote Building located at 1904 1st Avenue N. He stated that the building will have three tenants. **Tenant 1** will be the Valley Bank, and the proposed signage would be face-lit LED illuminated Channel Letters on aluminum that would be located over the first floor entrance. There would be a 1’- 6” x 3’- 9” ATM sign located over the ATM. **Tenant 2** will be the relocation of the existing Coyote signage. **Tenant 3** will be Watkin & Eager, and the proposed signage would include 2” deep reverse-lit letters with a 2” standoff from the building. The sign would be 3’ x 23’. The projecting sign would be 5’- 0”.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:45 a.m.