



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 10, 2019

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Don Cosper, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe, Sheila Montgomery-Mills

Members Absent: Sam Frazier, Don Cosper, Creig Hoskins, Lea Ann Macknally, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, John Sims, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters

Others Present: Mike Gibson, Matt Wilson, David Smith, Robert Eckinger, Judy Brady, Cale Smith, Wes Daniel, Hinter Finch, Richard Carnaggio, Austin Whitten, Katherine Smith, Phil Amthor

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Vice-Chairman Mauk. He stated that the draft minutes of the May 22, 2019 meeting were sent out and asked if there were any additions or corrections. Macknally made a motion to approve the minutes, and Wolfe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

I. Name: Mr. Mike Gibson (Creature LLC)

Site Address: 1143 1st Avenue South (Monday Night Brewing at the Denham Building)

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Renovation of existing single-story building

Statements: Mr. Mike Gibson was called upon by Mauk to present his proposal to renovate a single-story building (next to the Denham Building) into the Monday Night Brewing. Mr. Gibson started by pointing out that last year the DRC granted preliminary approval for partial demolition of the property. He said that when that approval was granted, there was a conceptual design but no client for the building. Now that they have a client, there is a clearer picture of the extent of the demolition. Mr. Gibson explained that Monday Night Brewing has two locations in Atlanta, Georgia and that this project would be their first location in Birmingham. Mr. Gibson said the last page of their design package shows a rendering of the project with a mural and signage. He said the mural and signage would return at a later day. Mr. Gibson said they were currently seeking approval to remove the garage, cut new openings in the exterior walls, replace existing siding, and paint the walls. While these activities are proceeding, Mr. Gibson plans to further develop his design scheme for the project. Mr. Gibson said they plan on doing the landscaping for both the Denham Building and the Monday Night Brewing Building sites. Mr. Gibson explained that the siding is actually metal roof decking that would be painted Sherwin Williams charcoal black.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 10, 2019

Cosper asked to see a site plan to better understand the location of the portion of the building that was approved for demolition. Mr. Wieseman recalled that the previous design had exterior skin made of wood while this design is made entirely of metal, and wondered if this was due to cost. Mr. Gibson agreed that the change of materials was due to a budgetary constraint. Mr. Cosper asked how the graphics would be applied, and Mr. Gibson said it would be painted onto the wall. Mr. Cosper asked if the canopy was a TVM, and Mr. Gibson said it was a custom laser cut bent steel awning over the main entry. Chairman Mauk called for a motion.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Ms. Jill Hopkins
Site Address: 3200 7th Avenue South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Ms. Judy Brady presented the signage for Ms. Hopkins. She stated that BBVA Compass is rebranding and changing its name to BBVA and that all signage on the campus will reflect the change. They will replace all panels and signage on the existing directory and monuments signs.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- III. Name:** Ms. Meighan Ellis (Advance Sign and Lighting)
Site Address: 2019 Highland Avenue (My Eye Dr. Highland Avenue)
District: Five Points South

Requesting approval for: Signage – remove existing “Schaeffer Eye Center” signage and install new “MyeyeDr” signage. (1) Building storefront sign and (1) Parking sign.

Statements: Ms. Judy Brady came forward to present this case in the absence of Ms. Meighan Ellis. Ms. Brady said they plan on taking down the existing raceways and “Schaeffer Eye Center” letters and replacing them with flush mounted channel letters. She also said that the proposed channel letters would be internally lit. Wieseman asked Sims if the size of the sign was within the City’s sign guidelines. Sims said that it was within the limits. Sims further said that the 6” space at the top and bottom are not enough. The committee discussed the merits of Sims’s observation and came to the same conclusion. Cosper and other committee members made a recommendation to reduce the height of the letters from 44” to 36”, thereby allowing the sign to be centered vertically and horizontally and allowing for more space at the top and bottom of the sign fascia band.

Motion: Cosper made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 10, 2019

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IV. Name: Ms. Meighan Ellis (Advance Sign and Lighting)

Site Address: 2100 Bessemer Road (My Eye Dr. Bessemer Rd.)

District: Five Points West

Requesting approval for: Signage – remove “Schaeffer Eye Center” signage and install “MyeyeDr” signage. (1) Building sign and (2) Monument face replacements.

Statements: Ms. Judy Brady came forward to present this case in the absence of Ms. Meighan Ellis. Some committee members wondered aloud about the symbols at either side of the sign, to which Ms. Brady said that the symbol represented eyeglasses. Ms. Brady said they plan on taking down the existing raceways and “Schaeffer Eye Center” letters and replacing them with flush mounted channel letters. She also said that the proposed channel letters would be internally lit. Wieseman observed that unlike the Highland Avenue sign, this sign is so long. The committee members made simultaneous observations that the 22” high sign leaves little space above and below in the 29” fascia sign band. Wolfe suggested reducing the height of the letters from 22” to 17”, but Macknally suggested that 18” might be better. Wolfe made a recommendation to reduce the height of the letters on the fascia from 22” to 18”, thereby allowing for more space at the top and bottom of the sign fascia. Wolfe also recommended the same 18” letter heights for the monument sign. Ms. Brady verified that the 18” height also applied to the logos on the building sign.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

V. Name: Mr. Austin Whitten

Site Address: 4409 6th Avenue South

District: Avondale Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Front porch modifications; painting existing fireplace; adding a new chimney cap and replacing vinyl siding with new hardie board siding

Statements: Mauk asked if there was a report from the Avondale Park Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the Advisory Committee recommendation was to approve the proposal with conditions, and that the applicant had agreed to the conditions. The ALHAC approved proposal with conditions. The AC voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request: 1. Railing height (Steps and Porch) to be 32’ unless otherwise required by Code. 2. Hardie Plank Siding to cover body of house. (6-1/4 exposure, smooth finish) 3. Wrap perimeter of deck floor with painted 1x 4. 4. The porch ceiling is to be beadboard, painted to match the trim, and in one plane a minimum of 4” above the bottom of the surrounding beam, interrupted only by a beam aligned with the column east of the entry stair. 5. The gable rake over the porch stair is to be symmetrical about the centerline of that stair. 6. The rake eave is to be smooth material painted and trimmed out clearly. 7. The framing of the roof will be adjusted to



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 10, 2019

assure that the ogee gutters on either side of the porch are in alignment with the gutters of the main body of the house. 8. The stair treads and deck boards are to be stained Sherwin Williams "Chestnut". The Local Historic Advisory Committee's Standard of Review Findings of Fact were as follows: (1) The proposed change, erection, or demolition conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change, erection, or demolition is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource; and (4) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: Mauk asked the applicant if he was going to put a gable on the house. Mr. Whitten stated correct. MacNally asked Mr. Whitten if he had a plan that shows how large the porch would be. Mr. Whitten explained that the site plan gives a general dimension of the length. Cosper asked if he was removing all of the awnings, and Mr. Whitten answered correct. He also added that the awnings were the home of a lot of wasps. Wieseman read all of the conditions on the recommendation form and asked again if Mr. Whitten agreed to all of the conditions. Mr. Whitten answered correct.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VI. Name: Mr. James Laughlin

Site Address: 4337 10th Avenue South

District: Forest Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Painting brick garage; adding two windows, light fixtures, and hose bibb to garage

Statements: Mauk asked Perry if there was a report. Perry stated that the recommendation was divided into two parts or motions. Perry explained the two-part recommendation of the Forest Park Local Historic Advisory Committee.

Part 1 of 2:

With the exception of the painted brick, the proposal was approved as presented. Regarding the first motion, the Local Historic Advisory Committee's Standard of Review Findings of Fact were as follows: (1) The proposed change, erection, or demolition conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change, erection, or demolition is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource; and (4) The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part, will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Part 2 of 2:

This motion is specifically related to the brick which has been painted The committee was split



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 10, 2019

with one vote to deny and one to approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: A. Exterior Siding: Original exterior construction and siding materials shall be retained, repaired and matched. Any change shall maintain the visual integrity and quality of original construction.

The applicant stated that he had to repoint the brick. It was noted that the garage is a different era from that of the main house.

Motion: MacNally made a motion to approve the renovations as shown.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: MacNally stated for the record that this proposal should have come before the DRC prior to the work being done. MacNally also stated that she would make a motion to approve the painted brick because the garage, a non-contributing structure, is a different era from that of the main house.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VII. Name:** Mr. Richard Carnaggio
Site Address: 1927 1st Avenue N
District: Birmingham Green
Requesting approval for: Aesthetic Correction

Statements: This case was last seen at the January 10, 2018 Design Review Committee meeting. At that time, the committee approved a new aluminum perforated metal wall to replace the brick façade, due to masonry wall failure. At today's meeting, Mr. Carnaggio is proposing to remove the newly installed perforated metal panels and leave the panel framework, steel structure, and stone base. He said that the panel design was not in keeping with the project's design intent.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VIII. Name:** Mr. Hunter Finch
Site Address: 2839 7th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Reviewing Exterior Repairs

Statements: Mr. Finch is to replace the wood and paint on the existing building to match the color over the transom.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to carry over the proposal to allow applicant to schedule a work session. The committee noted that it needs elevations with all details (dimensions and materials).

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 10, 2019

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IX. Name:** Mr. Wes Daniel (Daniel Signs, Inc.)
Site Address: 2839 7th Avenue S.
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Mr. Daniel proposed two signs, one on the 28th Street elevation and one over the 7th Avenue elevation.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to table the proposal to allow the applicant to schedule a work session.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- X. Name:** Mr. Cale Smith (MBA Engineers)
Site Address: 2130 11th Avenue North
District: Culture
Requesting approval for: Parking Lot (BJCC)

Statements: The BJCC is building a new parking lot on the old Salvation Army site. Mr. Smith stated that there would be new retaining walls at 11th Avenue North and 22nd Street North. The fence would be the same as the black aluminum fence on the 19th Street BJCC parking lot. The alley would not be vacated.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal.

Motion seconded by: Cosper

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried with Macknally and Montgomery-Mills recusing themselves.

- XI. Name:** Mr. Phil Amthor
Site Address: 1024 20th Street, South
District: Five Points South
Requesting approval for: Signage Master Plan

Statements: This case was last heard on June 12, 2019. At that time, the committee carried over the proposal to allow the applicant to return with details and a site plan. Today, Mr. Amthor presented the signage Master Plan with a site plan. He stated that he is proposing painted signs on brick with a neon element. He said that the proposed sign would be 18'x 3'. There would be two black goose neck lights per sign.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal subject to sign type B being a maximum of 18'x 3' with two goose neck lights per sign and painting them black for sign type A.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 10, 2019

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:35 a.m.