



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 24, 2019

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Don Cospers, Creig Hoskins, Richard Mauk, Brian Wolfe, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Chris Swain

Members Absent: Sam Frazier, Lea Ann Macknally, Ben Wieseman

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, John Sims, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters

Others Present: Brian Barrett, Corey Bishop, Geoff Boyd, Mick Britton, Christopher Brown, Wes Daniel, Robert Eckinger, John Forney, Logan Ghorley, Denise Gilmore, Rogers Hunt, Roxane Nelson, Jack Pyburn, Andrew Rhodes, Bill Segrest, Amy Smith, Brad Snyder, David Steele, Dan Taylor, Robert Thompson, Allen Tutwiler

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Vice-Chairman Mauk. He stated that draft minutes for the meetings of June 12, 2019 and June 24, 2019 were sent out. Updates were requested for the June 12, 2019 minutes. Cospers made a motion to approve the June 26, 2019 minutes. Hoskins seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

I. Name: Mr. Geoff Boyd

Site Address: 2000 University Blvd

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Temporary Openspace Put Back

Statements: Mr. Boyd stated that Ms. Smith would present the temporary landscaping for the open space created when the building on this site was removed. He stated that the long term plan was to place another building here, but in the meantime, the parcel would be landscaped, creating a park. Ms. Smith presented her plan that included raised beds, trees and shrubs. She stated that she wanted to create a space that would be comfortable for people to eat lunch. She also stated that she wanted to include tables and chairs on the site. She also included street trees along University Blvd. The raised beds would have seat walls around them, for additional seating. Ms. Smith stated that she also included a lighted metal sculpture on the site. Cospers asked what the scoring plan would look like. Ms. Smith stated that she was still working out that detail. Mauk asked if the seat walls would be lit. Ms. Smith stated that she hoped so, but that detail might get value engineered out.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, on the condition that the City landscape architect review the plan.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 24, 2019

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Mr. Christopher Brown (Architectural Specialties)
Site Address: 3008 Clairmont Avenue (Martin Advertising)
District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Install Logo/Letters on Front of Office Building

Statements: Mr. Brown presented his plan to install aluminum letters and a logo for Martin Advertising. He stated that the sign would be unlit. He stated that the logo would be 2” thick, and the letters would be ¾” thick. Montgomery-Mills asked if the sign fit within the guidelines. Sims said yes.

Motion: Cospser made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- III. Name:** Mr. Logan Ghorley or Mr. Steve Prather (Network Cabling Infrastructures, Inc.)
Site Address: 1501 5th Avenue South (McDonald’s Restaurant)
District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Exterior replacement of menu boards

Statements: Mauk asked if the sign was going to be digital. Mr. Ghorley said yes. Mauk asked if that was allowed. Sims said yes, as long as the sign wasn’t animated. Montgomery-Mills asked if the applicant had a site plan showing where the signs would be located. Mr. Ghorley stated that he didn’t have a site plan, but that the signs would just be replacing the existing signs. Cospser asked if there would be one sign or two. Mr. Ghorley stated that there would be two (one where your order is taken, and one in the queue for browsing the menu). Cospser stated that a site plan was needed.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to carry this case over, pending a site plan.

Motion seconded by: Cospser

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IV. Name:** Mr. Andre Bittas / Mr. David Steele
Site Address: 1510 5th Avenue North (A. G. Gaston Motel)
District: 4th Avenue North

Requesting approval for: Phase 1 Exterior Restoration

Statements: Mr. Steele and Mr. Jack Pyburn (Lord Aeck Sargent) presented his plans for the first phase of the renovation/restoration of the AG Gaston motel. The plan is to add back the doors that were removed, and enlarge the windows to restore the residential wing back to its original state. The plan is to work with the National Park Service to restore the hotel back



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 24, 2019

to its original materials, colors and finishes that it had in the 1960s. The applicant stated that he would also be reroofing the whole complex. Mr. Pyburn stated that three months of mockup work had been done. In Phase 1 of the project, non-historic fabric would be removed in order to prepare for Phase 2. When asked about the current sign on the building, Mr. Pyburn noted that the sign was installed in 1968, and because 1963 is the building's period of significance, the sign would be coming out. Wolfe asked if the applicant had a site plan or any elevations of the building. The applicant said no. Wolfe stated that elevations were necessary with all materials, colors and finishes called out. Ms. Rich commended the applicant for their hard work on this project.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the concept of this renovation on the condition that the applicant return with a site plan and color elevations with all call-outs.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried, with Hoskins recusing himself.

V. **Name:** Mr. Michael Britton

Site Address: 2737 Highland Avenue

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Erect a new aluminum ornamental sign

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked Perry for the report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the Highland Park AC voted to approve the proposed plan. The recommendation of the AC was to approve the design review request for the following reason: The proposed sign is attractive, appropriate to the property, and meets the Design Guidelines. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: General Commercial Design Guidelines, Article I, Section K (1): Sign shall be limited to those identifying the property or use conducted therein. The Highland Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Britton stated that he wanted to install a new ornamental aluminum sign. Cosper asked if the sign would be within the property line. Mr. Britton said yes.

Motion: Cosper made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 24, 2019

- VI. Name:** Mr. John Forney
Site Address: 3915 7th Avenue South
District: Avondale Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Relocating a window; constructing a new porch entry addition; and repainting the exterior of the home

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked Perry for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the Avondale Park AC voted to approve the proposed plan. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: The plans and design are in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood. The Avondale Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change does conform to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Forney stated that he wanted to add a front porch, and relocate a window on an existing structure. Cospers asked if the house was a contributing structure. Perry said yes. Cospers asked if the house would lose its contributing status if the porch was added.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as submitted, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried, with Mauk and Cospers voted against.

- VII. Name:** Mr. Allen Tutwiler
Site Address: 4401 5th Avenue South
District: Avondale Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Placing new vinyl siding and a new metal roofing on the apartment building

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked Perry for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the Avondale Park AC voted to deny the proposed plan. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following reasons: Materials applicant proposes to use (vinyl siding and metal roof) do not fall into the category of materials the committee recommends for construction/renovation within the district. If the applicant proposes to use a material other than the original material, the committee routinely recommends and approves the use of Hardi Plank type siding material and generally variations of composite roofing materials. The Local Committee has historically discouraged the use of these materials in previous cases. To make an exception in applicant's case would set a precedent that the committee discourages. The committee strongly requests that the City's Design Review Committee adopt this finding and



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 24, 2019

recommendation. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: Applicant's plan is not in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood. The Avondale Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change does not conform to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is not compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and detracts from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will not be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Tutwiler presented his plan to replace the siding with vinyl siding, and add a metal roof to the apartment building. Montgomery-Mills asked if the work had already been completed, Mr. Tutwiler said yes. Wolfe asked if a permit was obtained when the work was completed three years ago. Mr. Tutwiler said no. Hoskins asked what Mr. Tutwiler was asking approval for. He stated that the back side of the building had been damaged in a storm, and he needed to repair it. Mr. Forney, a member of the LHAC, stated that the case was denied because the applicant didn't show up for the local meeting. Cosper noted that the building is a non-contributing structure to the historic district.

Motion: Cosper made a motion to carry over this case over, so that the applicant could meet with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VIII. Name:** Mr. Dan Taylor
Site Address: 2205 7th Avenue South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. Taylor stated that he would be renovating this building. He stated that most of the exterior work would simply be cleaning the existing materials. He stated that the brick would remain, and that the storefront would be new, but would match the existing. He stated that the railing would change. Cosper asked if the applicant had a sample of the railing. The applicant stated that he didn't have it with him. Hoskins asked if the fascia would change, Mr. Taylor said no. Wolfe asked if the landscaping would change. Mr. Taylor said that the owner would like to remove the landscaping, but the Committee agreed that the existing landscaping screened the parking lot really well. Cosper stated that details were needed for approval. Wolfe stated that drawing details were needed for the stair/railing, and that in addition to a sample of the metal railing material, a landscaping plan was needed. Wolfe asked if any signage would be requested. Mr. Taylor said yes, but just on the doors. Cosper stated that a master signage plan would be needed.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to carry this case over, pending more information.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 24, 2019

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IX. Name:** Ms. Roxane Nelson (Blackwell Nelson Companies)
Site Address: 401 20th Street South (Bristol Southside Condominiums)
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Partial demolition of West Façade

Statements: Mr. Nelson requested to remove the stucco from the 1st through 4th floors of the building, in order to assess any damage or structural issues and to create a renovation plan for moving forward.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve temporary/exploratory demolition to assess damage, on the condition that the applicant return to present final plans.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- X. Name:** Mr. Corey Bishop
Site Address: Five Points West
District: Five Points West
Requesting approval for: Murals

Statements: Mr. Bishop presented his plan for a series of murals to promote the World Games. He stated that he would not paint directly on the buildings, but a material that could be removed (like wall paper) would be applied to the face of the building. Hoskins asked if he was asking for multiple sites for the murals or just for the Winn-Dixie site. The applicant stated that he was just asking for the Winn-Dixie site at this time. Cosper asked if just the letters would be applied to the building or if there would be a background. Mr. Bishop stated that just the letters would be installed.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal for the former 5 Points West Winn-Dixie site only.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- XI. Name:** Mr. Hunter Finch
Site Address: 2839 7th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Reviewing Exterior Repairs

Statements: Mr. Brian Barrett presented the case instead of Mr. Hunter Finch. The applicant stated that he would be renovating the exterior of the former Bird's Pizza. He stated that he would be painting and adding cedar siding. Cosper verified that the doors would be charcoal



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 24, 2019

gray. Mauk asked if these renovations were in line with what was discussed at the working session. Wolfe said yes.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XII. Name: Mr. Wes Daniel (Daniel Signs, Inc.)

Site Address: 2839 7th Avenue South

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Mr. Daniel presented his signage for the former Bird's Pizza. Cosper stated that the "Los Amigos" sign needed to be vertically centered.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve the signage as presented, on the condition that the 7th Avenue sign be centered vertically above the door.

Motion seconded by: Cosper

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XIII. Name: Mr. Bill Segrest (William Blackstock Architects)

Site Address: 1914 4th Avenue North (The Forbes Building)

District: Birmingham Green

Requesting approval for: Remodeling of building into unique office tenant spaces. In addition, the building's exterior will be slightly modified to provide a more unified window placement, and provide additional windows on the 6th floor and cleaned and painted building facades (Last appeared on the 3/27/2019 DRC agenda)

Statements: Mr. Segrest presented this case back in March, and stated that he was returning to present final details. He stated that a final color was chosen to paint the bricks. Cosper asked if any of the windows on the front of the building were changing, Mr. Segrest said no. Hoskins verified that the brick was previously painted.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Swain

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XIV. Name: Mr. Brad Snyder

Site Address: 3112 Ensley Avenue

District: Five Point West

Requesting approval for: Mural

Statements: Mr. Snyder presented his plan for a mural on the side of his business. The business will be a grocery concept, and the mural would go on the side of the building,



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 24, 2019

centered between two gutters. He stated that the mural would be reminiscent of old Magic City Classic posters.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve the concept of the mural, with the applicant returning to present the color.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XV. Name: Mr. Robert Thompson

Site Address: 2021 Morris Avenue

District: Morris Avenue

Requesting approval for: Window Replacement

Statements: Mr. Thompson stated that he wanted to replace the windows on the 2nd and 3rd floors of a building for a client. Wolfe asked what the materials of the windows would be. Mr. Thompson stated that they would be aluminum clad. Cosper asked if Mr. Thompson would restore the arched tops of the windows. Mr. Thompson said yes. He also stated that he wanted to use a thinner muntin bar. Wolfe asked if he was going to go back with 4-over-4 windows. Mr. Thompson said yes. Wolfe asked if he was replacing only the eight windows on the side. Mr. Thompson said yes, and that was it for the windows on the side, but that he would also replace six windows on the back of the building. Mr. Thompson stated that the sashes would be thicker than the previous ones. The light arrangement was proposed to remain the same, and the brick mold would still be flat like the existing brick mold.

Motion: Cosper made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, on the condition that the sashes line up with the existing sashes, and the muntins create equal panels.

Motion seconded by: Swain

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:50 a.m.