



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes November 13, 2019

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Don Cospers, Creig Hoskins, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Chris Swain, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Sam Frazier

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters, John Sims

Others Present: Janet Book, Sharon Bradshaw, James Chapman, Callan Childs, Ginny Farley, Mike Gibson, Jacqui Hart, Tony Kim, James Laughlin, Robby Pruitt, Matthew Smith, Tonya Smitherman, Brad Ward

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Vice-Chairman Mauk. He stated that draft minutes for the October 9, 2019 meetings were ready. Hoskins made a motion to approve the minutes, Wieseman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Ms. Sharon Bradshaw (Scott Services)
Site Address: 1819 5th Avenue North (PNC Bank)
District: 19th Street North
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Ms. Bradshaw presented her plans for a couple of canopies and a wall sign for PNC Bank. Ms. Bradshaw stated that the sign would be an illuminated box sign. Montgomery-Mills asked if there was a signage master plan for this building. Sims said yes, and that this sign fit into the signage master plan. Hoskins asked if the new signage still fit within the guidelines. Sims said yes. Wolfe asked if the only change in the canopies was their size. Ms. Bradshaw said yes.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: Wieseman asked what the height to the bottom of the canopy was. Sims stated that it would be the same height as the previous canopy.

Vote: The motion carried, 4 votes to 2.

- II. Name:** Mr. James Laughlin
Site Address: 2419 2nd Avenue North



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

District: 2nd Avenue North
Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. Laughlin presented his plan to renovate the Massey’s Mercantile building. Most of the renovations had been approved at the previous meeting. This time, Mr. Laughlin presented color samples, and clearer elevations of the proposed work to the rear of the building. Mr. Laughlin stated that the brick on the rear of the building is already painted and is beyond repair. Montgomery-Mills asked which color Mr. Laughlin would rather use. He said he’d rather use the more red color, over the burgundy one. (Macknally and Swain arrived as this case was being presented.)

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal, with the Fire Brick Red color to be called out where it would be going on the drawings.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

III.

Name: Ms. Tonya Smitherman

Site Address: 3150 Norwood Boulevard

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing existing wood windows, asphalt shingle roof, hardy siding, and wooden front door; adding a deck on the rear of the home; repairing sidewalk and driveway; and demolishing and restoring the porch brick wall to the right of the stairs

Statements: Perry stated that the case was approved by the LHAC as presented. The design review request was approved for the following reasons, based on the design guidelines included in the Norwood Historic Preservation Plan:

Page 12-Item C-Decks: Proposed Deck is located at the rear of the home and is not visible from the street, therefore it will be allowed.

Page 13-Item E-Doors: The proposed replacement doors are appropriate to the style and character of the house and are approved.

Page 13-Item F-Driveways: Repair of driveway in current location is approved.

Page 15-Item K-Materials: Reconstruction of brick wall is approved with bricks matching the original in color and size as best as possible.

Per the Norwood Historic Preservation Plan, “Alternative materials shall not be used unless such materials visually replicate the original exterior in appearance, dimensions, texture, etc. to every degree possible.” The proposed fiber cement “Hardie” siding is approved and detailed in the same manner as the original siding, which is shake siding with alternating short and tall coursing on the upper half of the house and under the



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes November 13, 2019

gable end of the front porch and lap siding on the lower half of the house.

Page 16-Item L-Paint: Proposed colors are compatible with the age and style of the house.

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs: New asphalt shingle roof is approved.

Page 19-Item U-Windows: Wood Replacement windows are approved in a 6 over 1 configuration for double hung windows. Single window at the front of the house should be either a fixed or casement 8 lite window to match existing.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: Page 12-Item C-Decks, Page 13-Item E-Doors, Page 13-Item F-Driveways, Page 15-Item K-Materials, Page 16-Item L-Paint, Page 18-Item Q-Roofs, and Page 19-Item U-Windows. The Norwood AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Ms. Smitherman stated that she would be doing a full renovation of the home. She stated that all windows would be removed and replaced. The roof, siding and front door would be replaced. Cosper asked for color samples. Macknally verified that the windows would be 6-over-1. Cosper asked what color the shingles would be. Ms. Smitherman stated that they would be charcoal. Wieseman asked what color the house would be. The applicant said white. Montgomery-Mills asked for a drawing with colors called out. The DRC requested that the applicant take photos and label all sides with the proposed work and colors.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Swain

Discussion: Montgomery-Mills reminded Ms. Smitherman to submit a labeled drawing of where the colors would go on the house.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IV.

Name: Mr. Tony Kim (Archiplan)

Site Address: 2520 12th Avenue (Exotic Hibachi and Wings 1)

District: 12th Avenue North

Requesting approval for: Exterior Painting and Signage

Statements: Mr. Kim presented his plan to repaint the restaurant and change out the signage. The signs will only be refaced. Mauk asked if there would be any new



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

landscaping. Mr. Kim said no. Montgomery-Mills asked if the canopy would be replaced. Mr. Kim said that it would be cleaned and painted, and that the parking lot would only be resurfaced. Montgomery-Mills stated that she was concerned that the proposed yellow paint color might not be appropriate for the area. Macknally asked if the client might be willing to entertain other color palette options. Mr. Kim said yes.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the proposal on the condition that the yellow color on the building be changed to a tan, beige, or off-white, to be approved by City Staff.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- V. **Name:** Mr. Johnathan Quinn/ Mr. Cole Osterholt (Sigcorp)
Site Address: 1429 18th Street South
District: Anderson Place
Requesting approval for: Painting mural on brick foundation of existing home.

Statements: The applicant was not present; therefore, the case was not heard.

- VI. **Name:** Mr. Rob Hale (Willow Homes)
Site Address: 4331 5th Avenue South
District: Avondale Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: New home construction

Statements: Perry stated that the case was approved by the LHAC. The Avondale Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

The applicant proposed to build a new residence in Avondale Park. Montgomery-Mills asked for the colors of the new home to be listed on one of the elevation drawings. Hoskins stated that the drawings of the garage needed to be corrected, as they may not be showing what the applicant intends to show.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the proposal as presented, with the garage returning for more/corrected information, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VII.** **Name:** Mr. Larry Hollis (Hollis Electric Company, Inc.)
Site Address: 400 19th Street South (Chevron Service Station)
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: This item was removed from the agenda.

- VIII.** **Name:** Mrs. Janet Book
Site Address: 3217 Carlisle Road
District: Red Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Motor court to remain at 18' wide instead of the approved 15' from the 9/14/16 DRC meeting

Statements: Perry stated that the case was approved by the Redmont LHAC. The Local Historic Advisory Committee approved the design review request for the following reasons: "The present owner of the property inherited the motor court and retaining wall as installed by the previous owner/applicant. The motor court was installed 3' wider than the 15' width that was approved by Design Review in September of 2016. The LHAC determined that the additional 3' of width can remain in this instance, as the concrete pad is already in place. Sherlock noted that the intention of the 15' width requirement was to prevent cars from parking in front of the house, and encouraged the new owners to keep that in mind, and not use the front pad of their house as a parking pad."

The Redmont AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mrs. Book presented her proposal for her motor court, which was already constructed, to remain at 18' instead of the approved 15'.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the request to keep the motor court at 18', in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IX.** **Name:** Mr. Brad Ward (The Sign Shop)
Site Address: 1501 3rd Ave. South (Sherwin-Williams Building)



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Signage Master and Sign

Statements: Mr. Ward presented his plan for the Sherwin Williams building. He stated that the owner was making room for five tenants, up from three. The applicant stated that the signage on the back of the building would not be illuminated. He stated that the signs on the front of the building would be illuminated (or not) based on the tenants' preferences.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to carry over this case, pending more information regarding minimum and maximum sizes of the signage on the front of the building, and more definition for the signs on the rear of the building, specifically the door signs.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

X. Name: Ms. Callan Childs / Jacquelyn Hart (Goodwyn Mills Cawood)

Site Address: 2730 3rd Avenue S.

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Final / Master Signage Plan

Statements: Ms. Hart presented her plan for renovations to a building at Pepper Place. She stated that the building would be all brick on the exterior, and the existing brick is already painted. Ms. Hart stated that the existing parking lot would remain the same, and a new patio would be added. Ms. Hart stated that most existing openings would be replaced with black storefront, and a few new openings would be added. Montgomery-Mills asked if the applicant had a site plan. She said no. Montgomery-Mills asked if there would be a wall along 3rd Avenue around the courtyard. Ms. Hart said yes. Hoskins stated that he was concerned about a 5' tall wall adjacent to 3rd Avenue. Montgomery-Mills stated that more information was needed about the courtyard area and the landscaping. Wieseman stated that what had been proposed so far was good and appropriate, but that more information was needed.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the building, but that the site plan and landscaping needed to return for approval.

Motion seconded by: Cospier

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

Statements: Ms. Childs presented her signage master plan for this building. She stated that she was presenting signage options, to tenants. She showed options for blade signs and flat signs at the entrance to the building. Hoskins asked if this signage was consistent with the rest of Pepper Place. Ms. Childs said yes. Cospier asked how many tenants were in this building. Ms. Childs said for now there is just one tenant, but it



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

could possibly be split into two.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the signage master plan, with the reference to “canopy signage” omitted.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XI. Name: Mr. Barry Crick (MAGIC CITY SIGNS / Magic City Neon Inc.)

Site Address: 2129 1st Avenue N.

District: Morris Avenue

Requesting approval for: Master Signage Plan

Statements: Sims stated that the renovation to this building had already been completed. Mr. Crick is back to request approval for signage. He proposed an internally lit blade sign that would include signage for all the tenants of the building. The sign will be 10’4” tall, and 11’ from the sidewalk. Hoskins stated that the sign was appropriate, except that it crossed the horizontal lines between floors. Montgomery-Mills asked if there was space for 8 potential tenants. Mr. Crick said that was correct. Mauk asked what type of graphics that the signs would have. The applicant stated that the signs would be black vinyl on white translucent panels, internally lit with LEDs.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the proposal as presented on the condition that the bottom of the sign line up with the bottom of the transom window.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XII. Name: Mr. Mike Gibson (Creature Architecture)

Site Address: 2218 1st Ave N.

District: Morris Avenue

Requesting approval for: Final approval on renovation design

Statements: Mr. Gibson stated that he was presenting his renovation design for final approval. He stated that for the new façade design, he took the feedback from the working session along with the clients desire to have an art deco façade and married the two. Mauk stated that he thought that this design was appropriate for the area. Montgomery-Mills asked if the canopies were cantilevered or if they had support. Mr. Gibson stated that they were cantilevered. Hoskins asked if the center column was illuminated, Mr. Gibson stated that it was up-lit. Cosper stated that he thought that the gold color was too bright. Hoskins stated that he thought it was appropriate.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, and thanked Mr. Gibson for taking the Committees suggestions with regard to the design.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XIII. Name: Mr. David Brandt (Fravert Services)

Site Address: 1817 3rd Avenue North

District: 19th Street North

Requesting approval for: Signage (Last seen October 23, 2019)

Statements: Mr. Brandt re-presented his plans for the new marquee sign for the Alabama Theater. He stated that at the last meeting he had been asked to develop a set of guidelines for the electronic reader board on either end of the marquee. Wieseman stated that the guidelines looked good, but the only thing that was missing was the timing for the changing messages. Mr. Brandt stated that 20-30 seconds is a standard, and he would be happy to add that. Cosper stated that animation was not allowed on the message board. Mr. Brandt stated that he would add that as well.

Motion: Cosper made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted, with the addition of the frequency of change and a statement that will not allow animation to be added to the guidelines. This can be submitted to City Staff.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XIV. Name: Mr. Brian Hawkins (The Color Project Ensley)

Site Address: 321 19th Street

District: Ensley

Requesting approval for: Mural

Statements: Mr. Hawkins presented his mural that was painted on the side of Gilmer Drug on 19th Street in Ensley. The Ensley community decided to paint a mural that personified it. They chose a young, African American woman who was strong and tough and artistic, to represent them. That was what was depicted in the mural.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Swain

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

(Don Cosper and Brian Wolfe left the meeting after the above case was approved.)



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

- XV. Name:** Ms. Ginny Farley (Trawick Contractors, Inc.)
Site Address: 1631 5th Avenue North (Freedom Manor)
District: Downtown West
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Ms. Farley presented her plan for signage for Freedom Manor. She showed the lettering for the sign. She stated that the letters would be internally lit, aluminum 1' tall letters, and they would be mounted on the canopy. Macknally asked if it would just be one sign. Ms. Farley said yes. Wieseman asked if the lights would be color-changeable. Ms. Farley said no. They would just glow white.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried. Hoskins recused himself.

- XVI. Name:** Mr. Larry Hollis (Hollis Electric Company, Inc.)
Site Address: 400 19th Street South (Chevron Service Station)
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Mr. Hollis presented his plan for new signage at the new Chevron station near UAB. Montgomery-Mills asked if the signs would just be changed out, one for one. Mr. Hollis said yes. Montgomery-Mills asked if the signs would all be the same size. Mr. Hollis stated that the new signs would actually be a little less square footage than the existing ones. The service station previously was a Texaco. Wieseman asked if the color scheme of the building would change. Mr. Hollis said yes, but that he was only there for signage.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 13, 2019

XVII. Name: Mr. Ben Wieseman
Site Address: 5532 1st Ave South
District: Woodlawn
Requesting approval for: Demolition

Statements: Wieseman requested partial demolition of this building. He stated that he wanted to remove the roof, clean the inside, clean the brick, and completely gut the inside. In the future, he stated that the building would be renovated, rebuilt, and occupied.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried. Wieseman recused himself.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:50 a.m.