



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes December 11, 2019

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Abra Barnes, Scott Burnett, Creig Hoskins, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Ivan Holloway

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters, John Sims

Others Present: Robby Austin, Terri Archer, Marc Bertolino, John Boone, Judy Brady, Asia Burgin, Mary Kat Cole, Brittany Foley, Christina Frantom, Dan Fritts, John Holmes, Savannah Holt, Paul Irwin, Dana McGough, Patrick McGuire, Casandra Numnum, AJ Prizzi, Shelby Raburn, Tad Snider, Carole Sullivan, Jim Swords, Justin Teufel, Brad Ward

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that draft minutes for the September 11, 2019 and October 23, 2019 meetings were emailed. Hoskins made a motion to approve the minutes as presented, and Macknally seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

I. Name: Ms. Cassandra Numnum (LMS Investment Management)

Site Address: 1701 1st Avenue Street (Parkside Apartments)

District: Midtown/Parkside

Requesting approval for: Temporary Banner

Statements: Ms. Numnum presented her plan to place a temporary banner on her building to advertise that apartments are available. She stated that it would be a temporary banner. She stated that the vinyl banner would be above Red Cat Café, and would face Railroad Park. She stated that she would use the LIV Parkside colors on this banner. Mauk stated that the phone number would need to be removed from the banner. Wolfe stated that the DRC could only approve the banner for 90 days, and she would need to return for approval if she needed it up longer than that.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes December 11, 2019

- II.** **Name:** Mr. Brad Ward (The Sign Shop)
Site Address: 1501 3rd Ave. South (Sherwin-Williams Building)
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Signage Master and Sign
Statements: Mr. Ward re-presented his signage master plan for the Sherwin Williams Building. He stated that the signage on the rear of the building was reduced. He also stated that he defined the signage that would be allowed on the doors. Mr. Ward also stated that he outlined what types of signage would (and wouldn't) be allowed on the building.
Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.
Motion seconded by: Burnett
Discussion: None
Vote: The motion carried unanimously.
- III.** **Name:** Ms. Catherine Holcombe
Site Address: 120 19th Street North
District: 19th Street North
Requesting approval for: New Bike Racks and Outdoor Furniture
Statements: The applicant was not present, therefore, the case was not heard.
- IV.** **Name:** Mr. Paul Irwin
Site Address: 1029 Glen View Road
District: Forest Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Rebuilding existing garage with added storage room and carport. All garage exterior materials would match materials of existing home
Statements: Mauk asked Perry for her report from the LHAC. She stated that the case was recommended for approval by the LHAC on the condition that the roof tile should match sample #3, and that the applicant should bring lighting samples. The LHAC recommendation stated that the proposal is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood. The applicant has agreed to both conditions. The Forest Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Irwin stated that he wanted to build a new garage on the site that was a duplicate of the original garage. Mr. Irwin presented his plans and fixtures. Macknally asked if the garage would be new. Mr. Irwin said yes, that it would be on the same footprint. Mauk asked if the garage could be seen from the street. Mr. Irwin stated that the house was on a corner lot and that the garage couldn't be seen from the front of the house, but could be seen from the side street. Macknally verified that the new access would be off of the



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
December 11, 2019

alley. Mr. Irwin stated that he would be using brick, clay tiles and wood windows to match the appearance of the original garage. The color of the doors and windows will match the house.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to carry this case over pending a site plan that shows how the new garage will tie back in to the existing site features, a landscaping plan, and an elevation with materials called out.

Motion seconded by: Oliver

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- V. **Name:** Ms. Shelia Montgomery Mills (BJCC)
Site Address: 1001 19th St N (BJCC – Legacy Arena)
District: Cultural

Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Macknally presented a renovation package for Legacy Arena. She stated that the focus would be the SW plaza on the site. The site colors would mirror those already approved for the new stadium project. She discussed site furnishings, and landscaping, and how those would complement the new plaza. Macknally then presented the lighting plan, stating that the lighting fixtures would match the new stadium and the BJCC complex as a whole. Swain asked who would maintain the landscaping, Montgomery-Mills stated that the BJCC would. The applicants presented their materials samples. Macknally stated that the big ramp would be taken out, and the new entrance would be at grade.

The applicant described the materials that would be used on the renovation, and where each material would go.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal as presented, with signage to return.

Motion seconded by: Oliver

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried. Macknally, Montgomery-Mills, and Hoskins recused themselves.

- VI. **Name:** Ms. Meighan Ellis (Advance Sign & Lighting)
Site Address: 2101 3rd Avenue South (Biomat Plasma Center)
District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Ms. Brady stated that she would be removing the existing sign and replacing it with a new sign. Macknally asked if it would just be one sign. Ms. Brady said yes. Wolfe asked if there was only one tenant in the building. Ms. Brady said yes. Wieseman asked if the signage met the guidelines. Sims said he would need to measure it. Macknally stated that she would like to see the sign moved up above the squares on



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes December 11, 2019

the building, to match the previous sign, so that the architectural features of the building aren't covered.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to carry this case over, pending verification that the signage square footage meets the guidelines, and so that the layout/location of the signage could be adjusted.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VII. Name: Ms. Brittany Foley (Williams Blackstock Architects)

Site Address: 700 Block 19th Street

District: Cultural

Requesting approval for: Greyhound Renovation

Statements: Ms. Foley presented her plan for the Greyhound building renovation. She asked for approval of the exterior façade renovations. She stated that she was pursuing historic tax credits. Ms. Foley stated that she wanted to take this building back to its mid-century modern roots. She stated that she would do her best to replicate the original details of the building. She stated that she wanted to restore the windows in the baggage claim area back to its original condition. The windows will have clear anodized, mill finished aluminum. Wolfe asked if the applicant would return with signage. She said yes. Hoskins asked how many tenants would be in the building. Ms. Foley said that ideally they would have just one tenant, but possibly two.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, with signage and landscaping to return for approval.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII. Name: Mr. John Holmes

Site Address: 4211 Clairmont Avenue

District: Forest Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Extending existing sloped roof over the existing sunroom flat roof and adding screened porch and patio in the rear, not seen from the street

Statements: Perry stated that the case was approved by the LHAC, and that the applicant wanted to add roofing over the existing sunroom, and add a screened porch to the rear of the home. The LHAC recommendation stated that the proposal is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood. The Forest Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
December 11, 2019

compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mauk asked if the changes would cause the home to no longer qualify as historic. Calvert said no. Mr. Holmes stated that the details on the new addition would match the existing.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IX.

Name: Mr. Patrick McGuire

Site Address: 4215 Glenwood Avenue

District: Forest Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Demolishing the existing garage and rebuilding a new garage with a second floor for storage

Statements: Perry stated that the case was approved by the LHAC, and that the applicant wanted to demolish and replace the garage. The LHAC recommendation stated that the proposal is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood. The Forest Park AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

The applicant stated that the existing garage was one story, but that he wanted to demo the existing garage, and rebuild a new one with a second story. He stated that the footprint would stay the same. He stated that the new garage would match the existing house. He stated that all details would match the existing, including trim, roof and windows. Mr. McGuire stated that it was difficult to even see the garage from the street.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

X.

Name: Mr. Gary Archer and Mrs. Terri Archer

Site Address: 3502 Country Club Road

District: Red Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
December 11, 2019

Requesting approval for: Modifying the front terrace; and adding new pavers and landscaping

Statements: Perry stated that the case was approved by the LHAC, and that the applicant wanted to replace the siding on the gables of the building only. The Redmont AC also made the following Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Raburn presented his plan to remove a part of the front yard terrace and replace it with stairs. Wolfe asked what the stairs would be made of, and Mr. Raburn stated they would be peacock pavers (concrete stamped pavers).

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: Mauk asked where the steps would lead. Mr. Raburn stated that they would provide access to the front of the house for guests.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XI. Name: Mr. John Boone (Orchestra Partners)

Site Address: 1064 20th Street South

District: Five Points South

Requesting approval for: Signage/ Cups

Statements: Mr. Boone presented his plans for signage and cups for the new Entertainment District for Five Points South. Sims stated that this application would follow the same template used by Pepper Place and the BJCC for their Entertainment Districts. The signage will be to delineate the Entertainment District, but there will be no signage painted on the street. Wolfe asked about the type of pole on which the signs would be mounted. Mr. Boone stated that the poles would be round, and would be exactly the same as what is at Pepper Place. Mr. Boone stated that he would work with the City to see how the poles should be installed.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
December 11, 2019

- XII. Name:** Mr. Matt Shelby
Site Address: 3120 4th Ave South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Renovation
Statements: Mr. Shelby presented his plan to renovate a brick building in Lakeview. The building will become office space. Mr. Shelby showed a possible phase 2 for the project. Mr. Shelby stated that he planned to add a second floor to the existing building. He also stated that the exterior has textured and painted brick. He said that he wanted to remove the texture and repaint the brick white. The trim and details on the front of the building will be cedar, and will have a gray stain. The windows will have a dark bronze trim, and the roof will be the same color. Hoskins asked if any vehicles or building materials would be stored in the backyard. Mr. Shelby stated that he might store a utility trailer in the backyard, but no building materials. Macknally stated that dimensioned and labeled drawings were required for final approval.
- Motion:** Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal conceptually, but final drawings with all details must return.
Motion seconded by: Hoskins
Discussion: None
Vote: The motion carried unanimously.
- XIII. Name:** Mr. Dan Fritts (Fifth Dimension)
Site Address: 1329 4th Avenue South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Revised Plan (Last seen June 26, 2019)
Statements: Sims stated that this project had previously been heard, but the scope has slightly changed, so it needed a new approval. Ms. Holt stated that the back of the courtyard would be enclosed, and a new level would be added to the building for extra capacity. Hoskins asked if the parking increased. The applicant said that it was not required.
- Motion:** Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.
Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills
Discussion: None
Vote: The motion carried unanimously.
- XIV. Name:** Mr. Robby Austin
Site Address: 2218 2nd Avenue North (Le Fresca)
District: 2nd Avenue North
Requesting approval for: Signage
Statements: Mr. Austin presented his signage plan for Le Fresca restaurant. He stated that he was proposing two signs: one above the door and a blade sign with the logo of



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes December 11, 2019

the restaurant. The first sign will be steel, painted black, with water-jet cut letters. The second sign will be an aluminum composite, white with black vinyl letters. Mauk asked if the first sign would be recessed back toward the front door. Mr. Austin said yes. Sims advised the applicant that a ROW use agreement would be needed.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:55 a.m.