



## City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 12, 2020

---

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

---

Members Present: Abram Barnes, Scott Burnett, Creig Hoskins, Richard Mauk, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Ivan Holloway, Lea Ann Macknally

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, Paige Lague, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters, John Sims

Others Present: Jeff Belyea, Matthew Bygrave, Cary Baker, Sharon Bradshaw, Mike Gibson, Will McGarity, Willie Oliver, Libby Rich

**Call to Order:** The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the 11/13/19 draft minutes were presented. Wieseman made motion to approve the minutes, and Wolfe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. Cary Baker/My Contracting Guy LLC  
**Site Address:** 1125 Cullom Street  
**District:** Cullom Street Local Historic District  
**Requesting approval for:** New construction - modification to the approved upper porch.  
(Originally presented on 5/22/19)

**Statements:** Mauk asked Perry for her report from the neighborhood. She stated that the case was recommended as presented for approval by the Five Points South Neighborhood Association. The Neighborhood Association also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Perry stated this project was originally presented and approved on 5/22/19. Mr. Cary Baker stated they pulled the front gable forward and preserved the retaining wall.

**Motion:** Wieseman made a motion to approve.

**Motion seconded by:** Wolfe



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**February 12, 2020**

---

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- II.** **Name:** Ms. Sharon Bradshaw (Scott Electric Services)  
**Site Address:** 9401 Parkway East (Shell Service Station)  
**District:** Parkway East  
**Requesting approval for:** Installing faces and cabinet on existing pylon from BP to Shell.

**Statements:** Ms. Bradshaw is proposing to upgrade the pole sign. She is re-facing the cabinet on the existing pylon from BP to Shell.

**Motion:** Wieseman made a motion to approve.

**Motion seconded by:** Montgomery-Mills

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- III.** **Name:** Ms. Sharon Bradshaw (Scott Electric Services)  
**Site Address:** 232 Roebuck Plaza Drive (Shell Service Station)  
**District:** Parkway East  
**Requesting approval for:** Installing faces and cabinet on existing pylon from BP to Shell; Changing ACM on canopy to Shell

**Statements:** Ms. Bradshaw is proposing to upgrade the pole sign. She is re-facing cabinet on existing pylon from BP to Shell.

**Motion:** Wolfe made a motion to approve.

**Motion seconded by:** Wieseman

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- IV.** **Name:** Ms. Sharon Bradshaw (Scott Electric Services)  
**Site Address:** 5904 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue North  
**District:** Woodlawn  
**Requesting approval for:** McDonald's new pre-browse menu board and new driveway menu board

**Statements:** Ms. Bradshaw is proposing to upgrade the McDonald's new pre-browse menu board and new driveway menu board

**Motion:** Hoskins made a motion to approve.

**Motion seconded by:** Wieseman

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**February 12, 2020**

---

- V. Name:** Ms. Sharon Bradshaw (Scott Electric Services)  
**Site Address:** 218 Gadsden Highway (Gadsden Hwy McDonald's)  
**District:** Parkway East  
**Requesting approval for:** Signage

**Statements:** Ms. Sharon Bradshaw is proposing to change the signage. Sims questioned if they are renovating the building. Ms. Bradshaw stated that she didn't know.

**Motion:** Wolfe moved to carry this proposal over.

**Motion seconded by:** Wieseman

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- VI. Name:** Mr. Gary A. Webb  
**Site Address:** 1029 Glen View Road  
**District:** Forest Park Local Historic District  
**Requesting approval for:** Constructing a new driveway and adding new landscaping

**Statements:** Mauk asked Perry for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. She stated that the case was recommended as presented for approval by the Forest Park Advisory Committee. The Advisory Committee also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Webb stated he adding new brick paved driveway.

**Motion:** Hoskins

**Motion seconded by:** Barnes

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- VII. Name:** Mr. Mike Gibson (Creature, LLC)  
**Site Address:** 300 18<sup>th</sup> Street South (The Citizen)  
**District:** Midtown  
**Requesting approval for:** New construction – 6-story residential building with ground floor commercial

**Statements:** Mr. Gibson is proposing to demolish the existing Well Fargo drive to build a 6-story proposed residential building with 140 350-square foot units and 3,000 square feet of commercial space on the bottom level.



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**February 12, 2020**

---

**Motion:** Wieseman moved to approve the demolition and the conceptual proposal as presented.

**Motion seconded by:** Hoskins

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- VIII. Name:** Mr. Will McGarity (Architecture Works)  
**Site Address:** 701 25<sup>th</sup> Street, North (Jones Valley Teaching Farm)  
**District:** Cultural  
**Requesting approval for:** Construction (Originally presented on 9/14/16)

**Statements:** This project was last seen September 14, 2016. At that time the committee approved Mr. McGarity's original proposal as presented. At today's meeting, Mr. McGarity is proposing a new headquarters facility. The exterior materials are fiber cement panels, horizontal siding, with a wood cypress/cedar rain screen. The roof will be standing seam metal. There will be two new curb cuts. The landscaping will be shade trees, ornamental trees, and replacement trees. They are providing a rainwater collection cistern. Sims asked if they were coming back with signage. Mr. McGarity stated yes.

**Motion:** Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve.

**Motion seconded by:** Swain

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- IX. Name:** Mr. Willie Oliver  
**Site Address:** 309 41<sup>st</sup> Street South  
**District:** 41<sup>st</sup> Street  
**Requesting approval for:** Signage, deck, and rear storage

**Statements:** Sims stated that the owner has painted a mural, constructed a deck, and installed signage. The owner was asked to produce plans to submit to the City for permits. Mr. Oliver stated that the owner constructed the deck, signage, storage and mural without drawings. The committee was concerned about the applicant constructing the deck, signage, storage and mural without a permit, and asked that the case be tabled until architectural plans were produced.

**Motion:** Wolfe made a motion to carry over the proposal to allow the applicant to return with architectural drawings.

**Motion seconded by:** Hoskins

**Discussion:** Ms. Libby made comments about the proposal.

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- X. Name:** Mr. Dave Branch  
**Site Address:** 1909 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue North  
**District:** 19<sup>th</sup> Street North



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**February 12, 2020**

---

**Requesting approval for:** New Parking Deck/ Demolition

**Statements:** The applicant was absent; therefore, the case was not heard.

- XI. Name:** Mr. Jeff Belyea, PE (Land Development)  
**Site Address:** 1201 3rd Ave South (UAB Student Housing)  
**District:** Midtown  
**Requesting approval for:** New Construction final

**Statements:** Mr. Belyea, presented his plan for 180 units of student housing, consisting of five levels of housing over two levels of parking. The development is located at 1201 3rd Ave South near the UAB campus. He stated that they were seeking final approval for the project and would return with signage and landscaping. Mr. Belyea said that they met with Mr. Fowler, the Dept. of Transportation Director, to discuss the entrance to the site, and Mr. Fowler suggested that the entrance should be off of the alley and not off of 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue. Wolfe asked if they were making any improvements to the alley. Mr. Belyea stated yes. The exterior material would be fiber cement panel, stucco, and brick. Wolfe stated that the brick base should be 3' - 0" so that the headlights could not be seen at night inside the deck. Hoskins asked what was the reason for so many stucco types and the pattern. Mr. Belyea stated that they were trying to blend the history of Birmingham with the surrounding. Burnett said the materials and color should be simplified, and that the massing should be studied. Wolfe said that the alley elevation was very interesting and that you should consider that look on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue elevation.

**Motion:** Wolfe made a motion to approve the site plan and carry over the design to allow the applicant to return with a design that addresses the committee's comments.

**Motion seconded by:** Montgomery-Mills

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- XII. Name:** Mr. Matthew Bygrave  
**Site Address:** 1043 28<sup>th</sup> Street South  
**District:** Highland Park Local Historic District  
**Requesting approval for:** After the Fact Approval: construct two new dormers

**Statements:** Chairman Mauk asked Largue for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. She stated that the case was recommended for approval by the Highland Park Advisory Committee on the condition that the new dormer match the dormers on the existing house.

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

1. Details of the new dormer on the North Elevation should match those of the existing house, including:



## City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 12, 2020

---

- a. Siding to match existing (#117).
  - b. Hip dormer roof slope, eaves, and soffit to match existing, including profile, overhang, and materials (beaded boards).
  - c. Corner board detail to match existing house (including quarter round detail).
2. Header is to be at least 2” wider than standing trim. (1x8 vs 1x6, for example) and should continue down the side of the dormer as a frieze board.

The Highland Park AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

**Motion:** Hoskins made a motion to accept the LHAC recommendation.

**Motion seconded by:** Barnes

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

### **XIII. Name:** Mr. Greg Malcom

**Site Address:** 1609 31<sup>st</sup> Avenue North

**District:** Norwood Local Historic District

**Requesting approval for:** Replacing front door, reconstructing rear entrance, replacing asbestos siding with hardiplank siding, and repainting

**Statements:** Mr. Stephen Gregory is proposing double wood doors and siding. Mauk asked Lague for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. She stated that the case was recommended for approval as presented. The Norwood Advisory Committee recommended approval of the design review request for the following reasons: “Although the proposed reconstructed secondary entry stair is located on the side of the house it was determined that is located far enough back from the front of the house so that it will not detrimentally change the overall appearance and character. Because of the specific location of the additional entry, in this case it will be allowed.” “Proposed double wood entry doors are suitable for the style and age of the home and are approved.” “If the existing siding cannot be repaired the proposed lap siding is approved for use on the main body of the house. The siding above the porch roof should match the existing cedar shake siding as shown in the provided existing image. If the shake siding cannot be salvaged, then a wood or fiber cement product of the same size and style is approved for reinstallation.” The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines: Page 12-Item C-Decks, Page 13-Item E-Doors, and Page 15-Item K-Materials. The Norwood AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**February 12, 2020**

---

conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

**Motion:** Wieseman made a motion to accept the LHAC recommendation.

**Motion seconded by:** Hoskins

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- XIV.**    **Name:** Mr. Stephen Gregory  
**Site Address:** 2 Norwood Circle  
**District:** Norwood Local Historic District  
**Requesting approval for:** Replacing front door

**Statements:** Largue stated that the proposed replacement door was recommended for approval by the Norwood Local Historic Advisory Committee. The Advisory Committee recommended approval of the request for the following reasons: “Proposed single wood replacement entry door is suitable for the style and age of the home and is approved. Original Transom and sidelights will be maintained.” The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines: Page 13-Item E-Doors. The Norwood AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Greg Malcom presented a proposed single wood replacement entry door suitable for the style and age of the home. The original transom and sidelights will be maintained.

**Motion:** Burnett made a motion to accept the LHAC recommendation.

**Motion seconded by:** Wieseman

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- XV.**    **Name:** Mr. Stephen Gregory  
**Site Address:** 2815 Norwood Boulevard  
**District:** Norwood Local Historic District  
**Requesting approval for:** Removing enclosed porch and windows back to original



## City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 12, 2020

---

opened porch; removing vinyl siding from front of the house; installing new front door; installing a new porch light and new porch ceramic tile floor; repairing damaged wood fascia; replacing asphalt shingle roof with asphalt shingle roof; and painting the exterior trim and existing siding of the house

**Statements:** Perry stated that the proposed replacement door was recommended for approval by the Norwood Local Historic Advisory Committee. The Advisory Committee recommended approval of the request for the following reasons: “\*Note that the work was done prior to meeting with the Norwood Historic Advisory Committee. This approval is given after work was completed.” “The installed entry door is consistent with the style of the home and is approved.” “Repaired damaged wood fascia appears to be consistent with detailing used in a house of this style and is approved.” “As far as the committee can tell, without being provided a historic photo of the house from the archives, the porch was restored to its original condition. Changes made are approved.” “Asphalt shingles are an approved roofing material, the installed roof is approved.” The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines: Page 13-Item E-Doors, Page 15-Item K-Materials, Page 17-Item N-Porches, and Page 18-Item Q-Roofs. The Norwood AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District. Mr. Stephen Gregory said that the front porch was enclosed and that the enclosed porch and windows would be replaced back to original porch.

**Motion:** Swain made a motion to accept the LHAC recommendation.

**Motion seconded by:** Wieseman

**Discussion:** None

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

### XVI.

**Name:** Mr. Wes Daniel

**Site Address:** 737 29<sup>th</sup> Street South (The Purple Onion)

**District:** Lakeview

**Requesting approval for:** Signage

**Statements:** The applicant was absent; therefore, the case was not heard.

**Motion:** Wieseman made a motion to table the case until the applicant is here to present.

**Motion seconded by:** Hoskins

**Discussion:** None





**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes  
February 12, 2020**

---

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:55 a.m.