



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 26, 2020

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Creig Hoskins, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Ivan Holloway, Willie Oliver, Scott Burnett, Abra Barnes

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, John Sims, Pamela Perry, Paige Largue, Tonte Peters

Others Present: James Laughlin, Robes Robison, Greg Allen, Geoff Boud, Mitch Watkins, Reid Fincher, Patrick Quinn, Chris Newman, Jacob Unzicker, Denton Lunceford, Peter Drake, Bill Dobbins, Kip DeArman, Jeffery Smith, Anthony Haydon, Dhivy Sathianathan

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Richard Mauk. He stated that the minutes were not ready at this time. The Committee reviewed Resolutions of Appreciation for former members Sam Frazier and Don Cosper. Scott Burnett made a motion to approve the resolutions. Lea Ann Macknally seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. Greg Allen (Scott Electrical Services)
Site Address: 9541 Parkway East (Metro by T-Mobile)
District: Parkway East
Requesting approval for: Signage Rebranding

Statements: Mr. Greg Allen of Scott Electrical Services said the proposal was to rebrand all existing signs from MetroPCS to "Metro by T-Mobile." Mr. Wieseman asked if the existing signs were on a raceway and Mr. Allen said they were. Ms. Macknally observed in a question if the size of the new sign is smaller than the existing sign and Mr. Allen affirmed that the new signs are indeed smaller in size than the existing signs. Chairman Mauk reiterated Ms. Macknally's question for clarification and received the same affirmative answer. Mr. Wieseman asked to see the cut-sheets for the pylon sign. Mr. Allen said he did not have it and would return to seek approval for the pylon sign at a future date. Several committee members asked Mr. Allen to pass out the sheets for all five sign applications from Scott Services so they could all be reviewed at the same time.

Motion: Lea Ann Macknally made a motion to approve the sign proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Ben Wieseman



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 26, 2020

Discussion: The committee members discussed and asked various questions about each of the five sign venues. Mr. Wiseman and Ms. McNally observed that the pylon sign update only applies to 5400 1st Avenue North address.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Mr. Greg Allen (Scott Electrical Services)
Site Address: 1141 Huffman Road (T-Mobile) (optional section of Parkway East)
District: Parkway East
Requesting approval for: Rebranding signage

Statements: Mr. Wolfe asked if the temporary sign still existed below the existing MetroPCS sign, and Mr. Allen responded in the affirmative. Mr. Wolfe said the temporary sign below the MetroPCS sign needs to be removed and the area repaired before installing the new sign. As part of the group review of the five sign cases brought by Scott Electric, the committee approved the sign proposal as presented.

Motion: Brian Wolfe made a motion to approve the sign proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Creig Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- III. Name:** Mr. Greg Allen (Scott Electrical Services)
Site Address: 3015 27th Street North (T-Mobile)
District: North Birmingham
Requesting approval for: Rebranding signage system

Statements: Mr. Scott Burnett suggested that the existing raceway lights be removed from the storefront windows before installation of the new signs. As part of the group review of the five sign cases brought by Scott Electric, the committee approved the sign proposal as presented.

Motion: Mr. Scott Burnett made a motion to approve the sign proposal.

Motion seconded by: Mr. Ben Wieseman

Discussion: It was agreed that the approval is conditioned upon the existing raceway lights being removed from the storefront windows prior to installation of the new signs.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IV. Name:** Mr. Greg Allen (Scott Electrical Services)
Site Address: 5400 1st Avenue North (T-Mobile)
District: Woodlawn
Requesting approval for: Rebranding signage – install sign on front elevation and reface existing pylon

Statements: Ms. Lea Ann asked Mr. Allen if the pylon sign is included in the request for approval of the sign proposal. Mr. Wieseman asked Mr. Allen if the owner would be amenable to remove the pylon sign. Mr. Allen replied no. Chairman Mauk said that of course the owner would not consider removing the pylon and Mr. Wiesman said he had to ask. Mr. Hoskins asked



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
February 26, 2020

if the total area of the building and pylon sign exceeded the allowable signage square foot, and Mr. Sims said it appears so but he was not sure. As part of the group review of all five sign cases brought by Scott Electric, the committee approved the sign proposal as presented.

Motion: Ms. Lea Ann Macknally made a motion to defer approval of the sign proposal to the Urban Design staff after evaluating the square footage requirement.

Motion seconded by: Mr. Scott Burnett

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

V. **Name:** Mr. Greg Allen (Scott Electrical Services)

Site Address: 2312 Warrior Road (T-Mobile)

District: Five Points West

Requesting approval for: Storefront signs

Statements: Ms. Lea Ann Macknally observed that there was no hardcopy for the 2312 Warrior Road address. Mr. Sims said that the banners in front of the building violate the city's zoning laws. Mr. Burnett asked to zoom into one of the slides to verify that there were no raceway signs behind the windows and door. Ms. Macknally wondered if the stickers in the windows and doors could be counted as signage and if not, they should be removed. Chairman Mauk recommended remanding the case over to the Urban Design Staff for review and consideration.

Motion: Mr. Ben Wieseman made a motion to defer approval of the sign proposal to the Urban Design staff after evaluating the nature of the stickers in the windows and doors.

Motion seconded by: Ms. Lea Ann Macknally

Discussion: It was agreed that the approval is also conditioned on removal of existing banners in front of the property prior to installation of the new signs.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VI. **Name:** Mr. Wes Daniel

Site Address: 737 29th Street South (The Purple Onion)

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: The applicant was not present; therefore, the Design Review Committee did not hear and deliberate on the merits of the case.

Motion: None

Motion seconded by: None

Discussion: None

Vote: None

VII. **Name:** Mr. Reid Fincher

Site Address: 3021 7th Avenue South

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Plaza renovations (New shade structure, hardscaping, and



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 26, 2020

landscaping).

Statements: Mr. Reid Fincher is proposing to renovate an existing plaza that includes new hardscapes, new landscaping, and a new 28 x 38 eggshell shade structure over the entrance to the courtyard. Mr. Fincher stated that they intend to use this area for small gatherings. Macknally asked Mr. Fincher if he had details of the structure. He stated no. Mr. Fincher stated that they intend to keep the 12' existing hedge to shield the fence. Macknally asked if the fence across the street was 8'-0".

Motion: Macknally made a motion to carry the proposal over to allow the applicant to label details and get zoning approval of the 12'- 0" fence.

Motion seconded by: Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII.

Name: Mr. Geoff Boyd

Site Address: 1918 University Blvd. (UAB McCullum Building)

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: This project was last seen April 24, 2019. At that time, the committee moved to approve as presented the first phase of the conceptual design, with the applicant returning with the final design. At today's meeting, Mr. Boyd stated that UAB is doing the second phase of the renovation on the McCullum Building. He is proposing a 68 million dollar renovation that will include a glass and metal panel façade with a small amount of brick. The ground floor will remain as is. He said the ground level is used for mechanical.

Motion: Hoskins

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IX.

Name: Mr. Geoff Boyd

Site Address: 2128 5th Avenue South

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Demolition

Statements: Mr. Boyd is proposing to demolish the old icehouse building located 2128 5th Avenue South and to temporarily use the lot as a surface parking lot. UAB has used the building for storage in the past, and then vacated it. He said the building is now an environmental hazard (asbestos) and a safety hazard for the homeless that trespass on the site. The long-term proposal will be a parking deck. He said that they want to increase their parking by 40 spaces to a total of 100 spaces. He used the existing curb cut. They will repair all perimeter sidewalks.

Motion: Oliver

Motion seconded by: Wolfe



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
February 26, 2020

Discussion: Macknally asked if there was any perimeter fence. Mr. Boyd stated it was on two side because of the grade change.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- X. Name:** Mr. Bill Dobbins
Site Address: 901 38th Street South
District: Forest Park Local Historic
Requesting approval for: Rehabilitation Related: replace windows; replace doors; reconstruct balustrade; and replace vinyl siding with cement board. Repaint

Statements: Ms. Largue submitted a copy of the Forest Park Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) recommendation. She noted that the LHAC recommended to approve with the condition that the applicant will return to DRC regarding lighting or landscaping. The Advisory Committee also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

The applicant's representative presented the application. Discussion from the Committee ensued. The Committee requested clarification regarding the proposed door replacement and balcony railing. Regarding the railing, the Committee asked the applicant to return with architectural drawings depicting how the railing would tie into the existing brick pier columnar supports and keyed plan. The Committee provided clarification to Mr. Bill Dobbins, applicant, and applicant's representative regarding the level of detail required for all DRC applications, including a clearly keyed plan and elevations noting materials and location of materials.

Motion: Creig Hoskins made a motion to carry over the application.

Motion seconded by: Lea Ann Macknally seconded the motion.

Vote: The Committee approved the motion unanimously.

- XI. Name:** Mr. Chris Wayne (Signarama)
Site Address: 7504 1st Avenue North (O'Reilly Auto Parts)
District: East Lake
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Mr. Chris Wayne of Signarama was not present at the meeting when called by Chairman Mauk.

Motion: None

Motion seconded by: None

Discussion: None

Vote: Not applicable.

- XII. Name:** Mr. James Laughlin



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
February 26, 2020

Site Address: 3906 Glenwood Avenue

District: Forest Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: To enclose an existing porch. The enclosure would include wood louvers and double hung windows to match the windows on the existing house

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked Perry for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the Forest Park Local Historic Advisory Committee voted to approve the proposal as presented. The Advisory Committee determined that the proposal is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood, and noted that the original photographs of the home near the time it was constructed show that the porch appeared to be either enclosed or semi-enclosed. The AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change does conform to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Laughlin began to present his proposal to enclose the existing porch. Mauk asked what the material and color of the louvers would be. Mr. Laughlin stated wood, and the color (Cloud White) would match that which is on the existing house. Mauk asked if Mr. Laughlin had any samples. Mr. Laughlin stated that the white color was in his package color rendering.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XIII. Name: Mr. Michael Britton

Site Address: 2803 Highland Avenue

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: To paint the existing monument and replace the existing church monument sign face with a new face

XIV. Name: Mr. James Laughlin

Site Address: 825 Conroy Road

District: Forest Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Removing and infilling windows with matching brick or siding material; replacing two French doors; and adding an opening for a new round casement window in rear

Statements: Mauk asked Perry for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the case as presented was approved by the Forest Park Advisory Committee. The AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes February 26, 2020

character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Laughlin presented his kitchen renovation and laundry room addition proposal. Wieseman asked if he would be matching the trim color that is on the existing house. Mr. Laughlin stated yes.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- XV. Name:** Mr. Anthony Haydon
Site Address: 3914 7th Avenue South
District: Avondale Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: To replace wood windows with new Fibrex (wood and polymer mix) windows

Statements: Mauk asked Perry for her report from the Local Historic Advisory Committee. Perry stated that the case as presented was approved by the Avondale Park Local Historic Advisory Committee. The AC also made the following Standard of Review Findings of Fact: (1) The proposed change conforms to the design standards established; (2) The proposed change is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value; (3) The proposed action will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect significant architectural features of the said property; and (4) The proposed change will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

After viewing the window replacements, Largue explained the concerns that the windows were in good shape and by the historic guidelines the windows should be repaired first, secondly replaced with the same material/design, and thirdly replaced with similar material/design. Mr. Haydon explained that he wanted to replace all the windows in the home with a composite material and matching design. MacNalley wanted to know the condition of the windows, since it is staff's concern. Mr. Haydon proposed to replace all the windows in the home, because they are completely rotten out in the frames of most of them. Wolfe asked if Mr. Haydon had a sample of the material. The sample was passed around, and Mr. Wolfe wanted to know what color they would be. Mr. Haydon answered that the interior will be white and the exterior will be sandstone. Mr. Haydon also added that they will be full divided light to match the existing. Wolfe asked if the paint was factory applied.

Motion: Weisman made a motion to approve the proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: None



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
February 26, 2020

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- XVI. Name:** Mr. Kip DeArman
Site Address: 420 20th Street, North (Previous Wells Fargo Tower)
District: Birmingham Green
Requesting approval for: Final signage approval

Statements: This project was last seen at the January 22, 2020 DRC meeting. At that time the committee approved the conceptual signage design. At today's meeting, Mr. DeArman is asking for final approval. Mr. DeArman is proposing a 52'-0" x 12'-9" internally lit white polycarbonate logo and letters. These signs will be located on all four elevations. Macknally asked if this building had a master signage plan. Sims stated yes. Macknally asked then why is the committee reviewing the proposal. Sims stated that because this a major building, the proposal was being reviewed.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the proposal subject to the applicant centering the signage and adopting the signage into the existing signage master plan.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: Wolfe asked if Shipt occupied 30% of the building's total floor plan.

Vote: The signage was approved with Burnett recusing himself. Mr. DeArman said they occupy four floors.

- XVII. Name:** Mr. Dhivy Sathianathan
Site Address: 9401 Parkway East
District: Parkway East
Requesting approval for: New Construction

Statements: Mr. Sathianathan is proposing a new Circle K Convenience Store located at 9401 Parkway East. The buildings on the site would be demolished and there would be twelve new pump stations. Wieseman asked if Mr. Sathianathan is closing any curb cut. Mr. Sathianathan stated yes. The building materials would be concrete block and EFIS.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve the concept, and asked the applicant to return with detailed architectural drawings showing building height and samples of materials, and in order to develop a revised sign plan, to review signage with staff.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: Macknally asked the applicant to remove one of the pylon signs on Medford Road and bring detailed architectural drawings.

Vote: The Committee approved the motion unanimously.

- XVIII. Name:** Mr. Jacob Unzicker (Mode 3 Architecture)
Site Address: 1300 5th Avenue South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: New Construction

Statements: This project was last seen at the September 26, 2018 DRC meeting. At that time,



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
February 26, 2020

the committee moved to approve the final design as presented with the applicant returning with the landscaping and signage. At today's meeting, the Mr. Unzicker stated that the developer has the purchased the full block. The proposed new development is a seven-story building with five levels of communal living space and the two levels of parking. Mr. Unzicker stated that this proposal is for the full block with 34 additional units and 64 new parking spaces. Mr. Unzicker stated there would be 4,500 square feet of retail at the corner of 5th Avenue and 14th Street South. They are asking for demolition and conceptual approval, and will return with the final design.

Motion: Hoskins moved to approve the conceptual design and demolition.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none

Vote: The Committee approved the motion unanimously.

XIX.

Name: Ms. Catherine Holcombe

Site Address: 120 19th Street North (Pizitz Food Hall)

District: 19th Street

Requesting approval for: Bike racks

Statements: Ms. Holcombe presented a proposal for a new bike rack. Burnett stated that approving the eyeglasses would open up the door for other company.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the option one location of the bike rack as sculpture and a branded icon for Warby Parker. She stated that the color should be submitted to staff.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: None

Vote: The Committee approved the motion unanimously.

XX.

Name: Ms. Catherine Holcombe

Site Address: 120 19th Street North (Pizitz Food Hall)

District: 19th Street

Requesting approval for: New patio furniture and signage

Statements: Ms. Holcombe presented a proposal for additional signage and patio furniture.

Motion: Macknally moved to deny the signage and asked the applicant to return with a sign that integrates with the fencing and the building. Wieseman moved to approve the patio furniture.

Motion seconded by: Burnett (signage); Oliver (patio furniture)

Discussion: None

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:35 a.m.