



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes January 13, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Scott Burnett, Ivan Holloway, Creig Hoskins, Richard Mauk, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Abra Barnes, Lea Ann Macknally, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, Paige Largue Thomas, Pamela Perry, Tonte Peters, John Sims

Others Present: Lauren Barrett, Zach Feldman, Hershel Hamilton, Majella Hamilton, James Laughlin, Chris Manes, John McCary, Rima Patel, Matt Shaver, Jamie Sransky, Brian Tye, Jeremy White

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:36 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes were not ready.

- I. Name:** Mr. John Forney (Architect)
Site Address: 4417 5th Avenue South
District: Avondale Park (Local Historic District)
Requesting approval for: ~~New construction of residence~~

Statements: This item was removed from the agenda.

- II. Name:** Mr. Jimmy Laughlin (Architect)
Site Address: 4445 Clairmont Avenue South
District: Forest Park (Local Historic District)
Requesting approval for: Construction of pool and ancillary structure



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes January 13, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

Statements: Thomas stated that the LHAC approved this proposal. There was the condition that drawings describing the required fencing around the pool be presented to the local committee for review. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

The Applicant's plan is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Laughlin stated that the owner wanted to add a small pool house and pool. He stated that the lot is large and encompasses 2.5 parcels. He also stated that the pool house would be identical to the main house in style, materials, and color. He stated that the pool house would be 14'x14' and would 1.5 stories tall. In addition, he stated that the pool house would have a metal roof, to match the porch roof on the house. He stated that the pool house would have columns to match the existing house. Mauk asked if the house was a contributing structure. Thomas said yes. Wolfe asked what the fence would be made of, and Mr. Laughlin stated that the fence would be a simple black iron fence, to meet code. Mauk asked if Mr. Laughlin agreed with the conditions of the LHAC. Mr. Laughlin said yes.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Holloway

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 13, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

III. Name: Mr. and Mrs. James and Jennifer Sransky

Site Address: 4230 7th Avenue South

District: Avondale Park (Local Historic District)

Requesting approval for: Removal of existing awning unoriginal to the house and construction of new awning

Statements: Thomas stated that the LHAC voted to approve this proposal as presented. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

Applicant's plan is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Sransky presented his plan to remove the existing awning on the house and replace it with a new one. The new awning will project 3' from the house. He stated that the new awning will repeat the same shape of the existing roof. He also stated that the new awning will be cedar and will be painted to match. Thomas verified that the brackets would be secured to the brick and not the limestone. He stated that the awning will be supported by brackets, and there will be a new light installed. The roof of the awning will have the same asphalt shingles as the main roof. Hoskins asked why Mr. Sransky didn't mimic the shape of the brackets on the back of the house. Mr. Sransky stated that he'd be willing to change the shape of the brackets to match.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 13, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IV.

Name: Mr. Jeremy White (Land Development)

Site Address: 1201 3rd Avenue South (The Marshall)

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Revision of Façade Material (Last seen 3/11/2020)

Statements: Mr. White presented his revision of a façade material on The Marshall. He stated that he wanted to change the color of the residential windows from white to dark gray. He stated that he also wanted to change the railings from a decorative mesh to simple vertical pickets. He also stated that instead of using brick pavers, he wanted to switch to concrete broom finish. Wolfe asked if this development was in the Parkside District. Mr. White said no. Sims stated that at a previous meeting, the applicant had agreed to use the Parkside Guidelines to inform their design decisions. Mr. Manes stated that they wanted to take all the brick pavers out of the plan, and replace them with standard concrete. Mr. White stated that if it would be acceptable, they could do a stamped concrete at the corners, instead of brick pavers. Wieseman stated that he was under the impression that the Parkside Guidelines were extended to I-65.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to carry over the case pending more information.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: Hoskins asked why the applicant wanted to make these changes. Mr. White stated that money was an issue, and also matching with their neighbors. Wieseman stated that maintaining the brick pavers was a better design solution for pedestrians. The material change adds to the health, safety, and welfare of the project.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to reconsider the motion.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve the windows and railings, and to carry over the hardscape revisions in order to confirm if the proposal is in the Parkside District.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 13, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

Discussion: Hoskins asked if the changes were monetary or aesthetic. Mr. White said both.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- V. **Name:** Mr. John McCary (RADERMCCARY, INC.)
Site Address: 3027 6th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. McCary presented his plan to replace and grow the existing storefront. He stated that he'd also like to replace the awning with a new overhead-supported canopy. He stated that the new canopy would project 4' from the building. He stated that he would return with paint colors. Hoskins asked if it would be butt-glazed. Mr. McCary said yes. The new canopy will be very similar to the existing, but the new one will have overhead supports. Hoskins stated that more details were needed for the new canopy. Hoskins asked if signage was going to be included with this renovation. Mr. McCary said no.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this project conceptually, with colors, canopy details, attachments, and framing system to return.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried.

- VI. **Name:** Ms. Catherine Holcombe (Arlington Properties)
Site Address: 1143 1st Avenue South (Denham Building)
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Bollards in front of the building

Statements: Ms. Catherine Holcombe was not present. Wieseman presented the plan to install bollards outside the Denham Building, for safety. He stated that the building has been hit by several cars that failed to stop at the stop sign across the street. Hoskins asked if the bollards were permanent. Wieseman said yes. Wolfe asked how many bollards would be installed. Wieseman said there would be four.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 13, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried, Wieseman recused himself.

VII. Name: Ms. Rima Patel

Site Address: 1032 20th Street South (Birmingham Apothecary)

District: Five Points South

Requesting approval for: Exterior Painting

Statements: Ms. Patel presented her plan to paint the exterior of Birmingham Apothecary, to update it and repair it. She stated that she wanted to paint, repair, and remove the rust stains. Mauk stated that the Committee doesn't like to approve painting previously unpainted brick. Wolfe also stated that the front of the building looked pretty busy. Ms. Patel stated that she would be willing to remove the posters in the windows. Hoskins suggested hiring an architect to help to reimagine the façade. Mauk stated that he didn't remember approving the canopy sign on the front of the building. Hoskins asked Sims if this site was part of a larger plan. Sims said he would check.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to carry this case over for the applicant to work with an architect and possibly have a working session.

Motion seconded by: Holloway

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII. Name: Mr. Lauren Barrett (Barrett Architecture Studio)

Site Address: 1420 7th Avenue North (The Ballard House)

District: Downtown Northwest

Requesting approval for: Fence and Handicapped Ramp

Statements: Mr. Barrett presented his plan to add a fence and handicapped ramp to The Ballard House. He stated that the new fence would be 3' high and would connect with a fence at the rear of the building. Ms. Hamilton stated that the fence would protect the historic house, and would also enclose a new community garden that is planned. Mr. Hamilton stated that there is currently no accessible entry into The Ballard House. He stated that the triple window would be replaced with French Doors and a deck, and the ramp would lead up to the deck to provide access. Hoskins asked what color the deck would be. Sims said they'd be painted to match. Wolfe verified that the railing on the



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 13, 2021**

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

(Video Link: <https://birmingham.webex.com/birmingham/j.php?MTID=mee271bfde95ba42df35d2310dd92b76c>;

Meeting Phone Number: 1/415-655-0002 or 1/312-5358110; Meeting Access Code: 146 794 5308; Meeting

Password: cR6DM3YynP3)

ramp and deck would be painted dark bronze. Wieseman verified that the ramp would be contained in the side yard. Mr. Hamilton stated that landscaping would be planted to hide the deck and ramp. Wolfe asked if the proposed fence would match the existing fence. Mr. Barrett said no, but that the existing fence was hard to see because of the landscaping. Mr. Hamilton stated that the fence was needed for safety.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:40 a.m.