



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Scott Burnett, Ivan Holloway, Creig Hoskins, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Sheila Montgomery-Mills, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Abra Barnes, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, Paige Largue Thomas, Pamela Perry, John Sims

Others Present: Josh Adams, Angela Brothers, Sabrina Cheshire, Kyle D'Agostino, Olivia Hallquist, Danny Hearn, Bolaji Kukoyi, Lyn Malcom, Corey Patton, Stone Ray, Brad Richards, Justin Rogers, Denise Simmons, David Steele, Grady Swicord, Robbie Washer, Bill Whittaker

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from 12/16/20 and 1/13/21 were ready. Holloway made a motion to approve the minutes. Wieseman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. Brad Richards (Contractor)
Site Address: 1112 26th Street South
District: Highland Park (Local Historic District)
Requesting approval for: Removing existing metal windows and replacing with vinyl windows

Statements: Mauk asked Thomas if there was a report for this case. She said yes, and that this house was a non-contributing structure for the neighborhood, and that the LHAC approved this proposal.

On January 17th, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Highland Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1112 26th Street South (Episcopal Place Apartments) and the Committee took the following action:



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

Approve(# of votes) 7 ; Approve with Conditions(# of votes) 0 ; Deny(# of votes) 0

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

The general look and character of the replacement windows match the existing in this non-contributing property. In committee discussion, the general feeling was the proposed window frames being lighter in color than the existing would improve the buildings presence along the street.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Section D, Windows (Page 10). " ...new units shall match the originals as closely as possible in appearance. "

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Richards stated that he would like to replace the windows at Episcopal Place Apartments. He stated that the windows are currently aluminum, and that he would like to change them to vinyl windows. Wieseman asked what color the windows would be. Mr. Richards stated that they would be a clay color.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Mr. Robbie Washer (Contractor)
Site Address: 1138 Lakeview Crescent
District: Highland Park (Local Historic District)
Requesting approval for: Building a covered porch over the existing deck 13' x 16' with tongue and groove ceiling with exposed rafters. Gable roof to match existing roof at back door.

Statements: Mauk asked Thomas for the report from the LHAC. She stated:

On January 19, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Highland Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1138 Lakeview Crescent and the Committee took the following action:

Approve(# of votes) 0 ; Approve with Conditions(# of votes) 6 ; Deny(# of votes) 0

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

The general look, character, materials, and details of the addition will complement the existing house.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

General Provisions: 3. Additions are permitted if they do not obscure or destroy the original structure. General scale and appearance should be commensurate with the original building.

General Standards for Review: 5....additions, if removedthe essential form and integrity of the original building would be unimpaired.

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

- 1) New rafter tails should be thicker (3") than standard dimensional lumber (1 1/2") to match the scale of those on the existing house.
- 2) 1x6 horizontal cribbing should be continuous between the stone corner piers (on the outside face of the existing and new deck posts) to conceal the structural discontinuity of the new posts resting on the existing rim joist.
- 3) New cricket should stay below the existing ridge.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Washer stated that he wanted to add a roof to the existing deck. He stated that he would be matching the existing gable to cover the porch. He stated that all materials would match the existing. Mr. Washer stated that he agreed to all the conditions set forth by the LHAC. Mauk asked if this addition was on the rear of the house. Mr. Washer said yes, but since the house was on a corner lot, it would be visible from the street.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

III.

Name: Mr. Lyn Malcolm (Contractor)

Site Address: 1520 27th Avenue North

District: Norwood (Local Historic District)

Requesting approval for: Removing front porch enclosure and vinyl siding to reflect original; replacing front windows to match existing; replacing front door; and painting exterior.

Statements: Thomas stated that this case was approved as presented.

On January 22, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1520 27th St N , and the Committee took the following action:

Approve(# of votes)....3.; Approve with Conditions(# of votes)_; Deny(# of votes)



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 13-Item E-Doors

Proposed doors are in keeping with the character of the house and are approved.

Page 15-Item I-Gutters and Downspouts

Applicant stated that should the existing gutters and downspouts need to be replaced the new gutters will be sized appropriately and the color will match the trim paint color.

Page 15-Item K-Materials

Siding appeared to be in good condition, painting the existing siding is approved.

Page 16-Item L-Paint

Proposed paint colors were not provided to the advisory committee. Committee assumes that the staff issued a desk approval for the proposed colors and that they are compatible with the age and style of the house Applicant has stated that the brick will not be painted.

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary)

Removal of porch enclosure to restore porch to original open condition is approved.

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative)

Committee approves the use of new trim to match existing where it cannot be repaired.

Page 19-Item CT-Windows

Proposed windows are in keeping with the size and scale of the existing windows and of a material allowed within the Norwood Historic Preservation Plan.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Page 13-Item E-Doors

Page 15-Item I-Gutters and Downspouts Page 15-Item K-Materials

Page 16-Item L-Paint

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary) Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative) Page 19-Item CT-Windows

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

established.

2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.

3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Malcolm stated that he wanted to remove the enclosed porch to make it an open porch, the way it was originally built. He also stated that he wanted to replace the front two windows to match the existing. In addition, he stated that he wanted to replace the front door, and remove the vinyl siding to show the original wood 305 siding, which needed prepping and painting. He presented his colors. They will be light gray (siding), white (trim) and a dark gray-blue (front door).

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IV. Name: Ms. Angela Brothers (Contractor)

Site Address: 3100 Pawnee Avenue

District: Highland Park (Local Historic District)

Requesting approval for: Installing black vinyl coated fence that looks like wrought iron fence and a walk through gate in front yard.

Statements: Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Thomas stated that there was. On January 19th, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Highland Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3100 Pawnee Avenue and the Committee took the following action:

Approve(# of votes) 0 ; Approve with Conditions(# of votes) 5 ; Deny(# of votes) 0

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

The general look and character of the proposed fence and landscaping is appropriate to



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

the age and style of the house.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

General Standards for Review: 5....additions, if removedthe essential form and integrity of the original building would be unimpaired.

M, Fencing: Front yard fencing should be appropriate to the age and style of the house and neighborhood.

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

- 1) We request City Traffic Engineer verify the proposed fence and landscaping meets corner sight line minimum requirements.
- 2) The rails of fence panels should be installed level, not sloped to follow topography. (Panels already installed are close enough to not require modification.)
- 3) Posts should have finials or caps.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Ms. Brothers stated that she agreed with the conditions set forth by the LHAC. She stated that she wanted to fence in her front yard for safety. Burnett asked if the fence was vinyl, or if it was vinyl coated aluminum. She stated that it was vinyl coated aluminum. Macknally agreed that that should be pretty durable. Ms. Brothers stated that it was meant to look like a wrought iron fence. Macknally stated that she approved the landscaping that was presented as long as sight lines are not obstructed.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- V. **Name:** Mr. Justin Rogers (Five South)
Site Address: 4901 1st Avenue North
District: Woodlawn
Requesting approval for: Demolition /Parking Lot

Statements: Mr. Rogers presented his case to demolish a building and remove the paving from the lot. He said that, long term, the owner wanted to extend their campus into this lot. In the short-term, he stated that he wanted to create a temporary parking lot on the site that the adjacent businesses could use. He stated that the temporary lot would be stone, held in place with railroad ties with landscaping at the street. Hoskins asked if the existing building had a concrete slab that could be used as a parking lot. Mr. Rogers stated that it could, but that the owner wanted to remove everything from the site so that it was ready to build on. Wieseman asked for a conceptual massing diagram to show what the future building might look like to establish intent. He also wanted the applicant to look at the ROW and look at how that will be laid out in the future including curb cuts and landscaping.

Motion: Holloway made a motion to approve the demolition of this building on the condition that the applicant return with conceptual drawings of what the future building and ROW will look like.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VI. **Name:** Mr. Bill Whittaker
Site Address: 2930 4th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Renovations (last seen 12/16/20)

Statements: Mr. Swicord presented his plan to expand his business. Sims stated that the applicant had taken the advice of the DRC and had incorporated it into their new plans. He stated that they moved the corner of the building out to the street, adding an additional wing. He stated that the parking would be in the rear. He stated that the building will be brick. Burnett asked if the comments had been incorporated into the new plans. Sims said yes. Wieseman stated that he wanted to commend the owner for



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

working with the DRC on making this project the best it can be.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VII.** **Name:** Mr. David Steele (Lord Aeck Sargent)
 Site Address: 1500 6th Avenue North (St. Paul United Methodist Church)
 District: Downtown Northwest
 Requesting approval for: Exterior Restoration

Statements: Mr. Steele presented his plan to restore the exterior of St. Paul UMC. He stated the he would be replacing the roof, gutters, and downspouts. The exterior will be cleaned and there will be some selective repointing. He stated that the building wouldn't look much different, but it would be much better maintained. He also stated that the cross would be replaced. Wieseman asked if the colors would match existing. Mr. Steele said yes. Mr. Steele stated that the front door would also be replaced with a pair of wooden double doors. Macknally verified that the new front doors would match the existing. They would be simple, flush wood doors, as influenced by the Historic Structure Report.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal on the condition that the new front doors match the original architecture, as approved by the NPS.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VIII.** **Name:** Ms. Denise Simmons
 Site Address: 810 St. Vincent Dr
 District: Lakeview
 Requesting approval for: Sign (Last seen 12/16/20)

Statements: Ms. Simmons presented her plan to replace the monument signs, and replace the fountain with a ground emblem. She stated that the questions about the monument signs, landscaping, and setbacks had been addressed. Mr. Patton presented the setbacks of the new signs, stating that the visibility triangle would be clear around each corner. Wolfe asked what the base of the new sign would be. Mr. Patton stated that his would be aluminum cladding above ground, and concrete below ground. Mauk



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
January 27, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Webex Video & Teleconference

asked if the sign would be illuminated. Ms. Simmons said yes. Wieseman stated that he appreciated the applicant returning with more information.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IX. Name:** Mr. Kyle D'Agostino (Poole & Company Architects, LLC)
Site Address: 1301 1ST Avenue South (Pago Pago Bar)
District: Midtown (Urban Supply District)
Requesting approval for: Schematic Design

Statements: Mr. D'Agostino presented his schematic design for a new tenant in the Urban Supply District. The new bar would be made of two 20' shipping containers, and would include a restroom. Customers will not enter the shipping containers, but will order from an opening in them. He stated that the canopies would be corrugated metal deck, and would be painted to match the Urban Supply district scheme. Mr. D'Agostino stated that the signage would return. He stated that Polynesian designs would be painted on the ends of the shipping containers. He stated that the ground cover would be decomposed granite, and the shipping containers would be painted steel. Wieseman asked how many parking spaces would be removed to create this space. Mr. D'Agostino stated that no parking would be removed. Sims advised Mr. D'Agostino that he would need to have a dumpster and dumpster enclosure when he returns with his final design. Sims stated that this approval would be conceptual and that Mr. D'Agostino would need to return for final approval, including landscaping and signage.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:25 a.m.