



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 28, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Birmingham City Hall, 3rd Floor Council Chamber

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate.

Members Present: Abra Barnes, Scott Burnett, Creig Hoskins, Richard Mauk, Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Ivan Holloway, Lea Ann Macknally, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Pamela Perry, John Sims

Others Present: David Brandt, Randy Britton, Jared Bussey, Jim Crittenden, Anthony Haydon,

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 7/14/2021 meeting were ready. Wieseman made a motion to approve the minutes. Hoskins seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. David Steele (Lord Aeck Sargent)
Site Address: 1510 5th Avenue North (A. G. Gaston Motel)
District: 4th Avenue North
Requesting approval for: Phase 2 / Landscaping (Last seen 5/26/21)

Statements: The applicant was not present; therefore, the case was not heard.

- II. Name:** Mr. Randy Britton
Site Address: 2630 7th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. Britton presented his plan to renovate a multi-tenant warehouse. Mr. Britton stated that most of the changes would be to the interior of the building. Mr. Britton stated that he wanted to remove the paneling from the second building and replace it with brick. He stated that the canopy would be removed, and the storefront would be replaced. Mauk asked if the building would be painted. Mr. Britton stated that



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 28, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Birmingham City Hall, 3rd Floor Council Chamber

the owner wanted to paint a racing stripe around the building. Mauk asked if the corner building would be changed at all. Mr. Britton stated that only the gray stripe would be added, and the canopy would be removed. Burnett asked what color of red brick Mr. Britton would be using. Mr. Britton stated that he hadn't chosen yet.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal on the condition that City staff approves the red brick, and that signage and landscaping returns for approval.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: Hoskins explained that color and material samples were necessary in order to have a record of what was approved by the DRC. Sims asked if he could email a sample of the brick. Montgomery-Mills said no. Mauk verified that Mr. Britton wasn't asking for signage or landscaping approval at this time. Wolfe explained that the brick that is presented to staff needs to be on a sample board with the specific color/style called out.

Vote: The motion carried. Wieseman voted against.

III.

Name: Mr. Anthony Haydon

Site Address: 1245 23rd Street South

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing 17 windows

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that the proposal was approved as presented by the LHAC, and that the site is a non-contributing structure.

On July 24, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Highland Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1245 23rd St S, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

The replacement windows are virtually identical to the existing/original windows.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

“Original windows should be maintained and repair as necessary, including replacing broken panes with matching new ones, and repairing or replacing framing elements with new pieces to match the originals. Wood framing elements and sashes should be kept well painted. Where window replacement is necessary due to extreme deterioration or damage, new units shall match the



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 28, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Birmingham City Hall, 3rd Floor Council Chamber

originals as closely as possible in appearance. Addition of window types not in keeping with the style of the building, e.g., picture windows, will be discouraged.”

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Haydon stated that he wanted to replace the windows on the home. He stated that windows would look and feel like wood windows but would be a wood/wood polymer mix. Wolfe asked if the windows would have simulated divided lights. The applicant said yes.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC. He also stated that the approval was based on the fact that the LHAC approved the windows, and because the home is a non-contributing structure to the neighborhood.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried, Mauk voted against.

- IV. Name:** Mr. Jared Bussey (Architectural Cooperative)
Site Address: 3213 Carlisle Road
District: Red Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: New home construction

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that the proposal was approved on condition by the LHAC, and that the site is a non-contributing structure.

On July 22, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Red



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 28, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Birmingham City Hall, 3rd Floor Council Chamber

Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3213 Carlisle Road, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to approve the request for the following reasons:

1. The proposed structure is compatible in scale, character, material, and level of detail with the neighborhood.
2. The orientation of the house to the street, rather than the lot lines, as well as the dropped main floor elevation, allows the structure to fit in with the adjacent neighboring properties on a difficult lot. The applicant has modified the site plan based on the past committee comments.
3. The front parking area, while not ideal, is necessary in this instance because of the extremely difficult lot. The reorientation of the house on the lot to align with its neighbors has created a hardship of a reduced rear parking area. Additionally, the front parking is 10 feet below street level and more easily camouflaged than if it were at street level.

The recommendation of the LHAC was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: III.1, III.10, III.13.

The LHAC also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request: The conditional approval is based on committee approval of a forthcoming modified window lite pattern.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Bussey stated that the applicant agreed with the conditions. Mr. Bussey presented his plan to build a new home on a lot on Carlisle Road. He stated that the home would



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 28, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Birmingham City Hall, 3rd Floor Council Chamber

be traditional and would be in the Arts and Crafts style to fit in with the neighborhood. Wolfe asked for the applicant to walk through the materials that he planned to use. Mr. Bussey stated that the house would mainly have stained cedar shake siding, painted wood windows, bronze metal chimney cap, and metal coping. He also presented his color palette. Mr. Bussey also presented his landscaping plan. Wieseman asked if the owner would be agreeable to adding an evergreen shrub hedgerow between the parking pad and the street.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, on the condition that the evergreen shrub hedgerow is added to the landscaping plan.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: Montgomery-Mills asked to see the lot layout and a landscaping plan.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

V.

Name: Mr. Jim Crittenden

Site Address: 1404 3rd Avenue South (Parkside Apartments)

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Material change (Last seen 4/24/19)

Statements: Mr. Crittenden presented his plan to change some materials on his development. He stated that he would be removing the stone on the façade and changing it to a white brick. He also stated that the architectural metal panels would be changed to lap siding. He stated that the material change is due to the difficulty in obtaining certain building materials. He also stated that CMU piers were going to be removed.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VI.

Name: Mr. David Brandt (Fravert Services)

Site Address: 2317 3rd Avenue North

District: 2nd Avenue North

Requesting approval for: Signage Master Plan (Last seen 6/21/21)

Statements: Mr. Brandt was not ready to present this case at this time.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 28, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: Birmingham City Hall, 3rd Floor Council Chamber

- VII. Name:** Ms. Shelia Montgomery Mills (BJCC)
Site Address: 1001 19th Street North (BJCC – Legacy Arena)
District: Cultural
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Mr. Brandt presented his signage plan for the BJCC Legacy Arena. He stated that most of the package would be signage updates. He presented new directional signage for the arena area. This new signage will be consistent with the wayfinding signage at Protective Stadium. There will be two large Legacy Arena signs going on the faces of the building. He stated that there would be a sign each on the north and south sides of the building. He stated that the new signs would be of the same type of sign, but instead of the words being stacked, they would be horizontal. Barnes asked if all the directional signage would be black and white. Mr. Brandt said yes. He also stated that the secondary directional signage would have the blue and yellow Legacy logo on them.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried, Montgomery-Mills, Burnett, and Hoskins recused themselves.

Wieseman stated that verbiage needed to be added to the DRC Guidelines regarding how to assess non-contributing structures in local historic districts. Wolfe stated that it seemed like the LHAC's wanted to treat contributing and non-contributing structures differently. Wieseman stated that he wanted to help homeowners find an easier path to approval for renovations for non-contributing structures.

Burnett made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Wolfe seconded. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:10 a.m.