



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate. In addition, please note that prior to obtaining any permit(s), all applicants must meet with Zoning staff to determine compliance with the Zoning regulations. Design Review approval does NOT mean that Zoning has approved the request.

Members Present: Abra Barnes, Scott Burnett, Ivan Holloway, Creig Hoskins, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, Pamela Perry, John Sims

Others Present: Christopher Baggett, Joel Blackstock, Allen Bolton, David Brandt, Richard Carnaggio, Marcus Carson, Miriam Cowan, Dan Fritts, Roman Gary, Don Hawes, Anthony Haydon, Binx Newton, Elizabeth Sanfelippo, Boone Stutz

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 10/27/21 meeting were ready. Holloway made a motion to approve the minutes. Wieseman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Ms. Stephanie Britton (Fifth Dimension)
Site Address: 1329 4th Avenue South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Revised Plan (Last seen December 11, 2019)

Statements: Mr. Fritts presented his plan to modify a previously approved plan. He stated that the site plan had not changed. He stated that on the elevation the material that was previously core-ten metal will now be a fibrous-cement board. He also stated that previously the front had an aluminum storefront system, but now it just has windows, but they will be the same material and finish as previously approved. He also stated that



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

two new aluminum canopies were added. He stated that the canopy materials would match what has been previously approved. He also stated that the windows at the top floor would now be 8' tall instead of 10' tall. Macknally asked if the core-ten metal would still be on the ground level. Mr. Fritts said no, that all of the core-ten metal would be switched to the fiber-cement board.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal as submitted.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Mr. David Brandt (Fravert Services)
Site Address: 2317 3rd Avenue North
District: 2nd Avenue North
Requesting approval for: Signage Master Plan (Last seen 7/28/21)

Statements: Mr. Brandt presented his plan for a new master signage plan for a two-tenant building. He stated that one tenant would get painted signs on the east and west facades of the building. He also stated that there would be a smaller 4x4 blade sign at the center of the building. He stated that the sign would be lit, but that only the letters would be lit. Mr. Brandt stated that door vinyl would also be allowed. Mauk asked if this proposal met the Design Guidelines. Sims said yes.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as submitted.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- III. Name:** Ms. Becky Carpenter
Site Address: 1014 14th Street South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Modification of Signage Master plan

Statements: Ms. Carpenter stated that the landlord signage would remain the same, but that this new plan affected the tenant signage. Macknally asked if all the new signage still fit within the allowable square footage. Sims said yes. Ms. Carpenter stated that she wanted to change the location of the blade sign. She also stated that there would be a blade sign on either end as well. He stated that the signage over the main entrance would be moved to the corner.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the changes to the master signage plan.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried. Wolfe and Burnett recused themselves.

Statements: Ms. Carpenter also stated that the building had some temporary signage up that needed approval. Montgomery-Mills stated that the DRC could only approve the temporary signage for 90 days.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve the temporary signage for 90 days.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried, Wolfe and Burnett recused themselves.

- IV. Name:** Mr. Anthony Haydon (Contractor)/ Ms. Elizabeth Sanfelippo (Homeowner)
Site Address: 1431 33rd Street South
District: Highland Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Replacing a window on back of house

Statements: Mauk asked Perry if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that this project was approved by the Highland Park LHAC. She also stated that this is a contributing structure.

On 11/4/21, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Country Club Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1431 33rd St. S, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

The alterations and repairs are consistent with the Historic District and the style of the house.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Haydon stated that he wanted to replace a window on the rear of the house. He stated that the current window was wood, and that the new window would be a 40% wood/60% polymer window. Macknally asked if it was just the one window that would be replaced. Mr. Haydon said yes. Macknally asked if the color and style would match the existing. Mr. Haydon said yes.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

V. **Name:** Ms. Elizabeth Sanfelippo (Homeowner)

Site Address: 1431 33rd Street South

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Porch repair and porch roof replacement.

Statements: Mauk asked Perry if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that this project was approved as presented by the Highland Park LHAC.

On 11/4/21, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Country Club Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1431 33rd St. S, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

The alterations and repairs are consistent with the Historic District and the style of the house.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.

2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Ms. Sanfelippo presented her plan to repair some rot on the columns of her front porch, and to replace the porch roof. Macknally verified that the column shape and colors would remain the same. Macknally verified that the roof would be replaced with another copper roof.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VI. Name: Mr. Anthony Haydon (Contractor)/Ms. Katherine Rose-Byington (Homeowner)

Site Address: 2617 11th Avenue South

District: Highland Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing 5 windows

Statements: Mauk asked Perry if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that this project was approved with conditions by the Highland Park LHAC.

On 11/4/21 the LHAC of the Highland Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 2617 11th Ave. S and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the LHAC was to approve with conditions the design review request for the following reasons: Installation of new windows will require extensive work to replace rotted wood. Installation is approved on the condition that the new windows don't require the appearance of the exterior trim to be altered in any way.

The LHAC approved the project for the following reasons: Project is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the Forest Park neighborhood and historical neighborhood design review guidelines.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

established.

2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.

3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Haydon presented his plan to replace 5 wood windows with 5 windows that are 40% wood/60% polymer windows. He stated that the windows would match the existing in form and color.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC, on the condition that the applicant abide by the conditions stipulated by the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VII. Name: Ms. Tracey Gerelds (Contractor)/Ms. Tamika Everett (Homeowner)

Site Address: 1414 32nd Street North

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing Windows

Statements: Mauk asked Perry if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that this project was approved as presented by the Norwood LHAC.

On November 8, 2021, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1414 32nd St. N, and the Committee took the following action: Deny.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to deny the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 19-Item U-Windows

"The windows of a historic home are an important feature of the home's architecture. For that reason, every effort should be made to preserve and maintain original windows ...Replacement of entire windows shall be discouraged. However. If window replacement is unavoidable because of deterioration, new frame units are to match the



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

original window in terms of material, style, light pattern (design), construction, and proportions ...Alternative means of reducing energy consumption, such as interior or exterior storm windows shall be encouraged."

The proposed window configuration does not match the original window in light pattern. Applicant is encouraged to pursue storm windows if energy efficiency is a concern. Committee's preference is to keep the original windows in place.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Page 19-Item U-Windows

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: do not conform to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is not compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

The applicant stated that the original proposal was denied because the light pattern of the proposed windows did not match the existing windows. The applicant stated that after the LHAC meeting, he met with the homeowner who then agreed to replace the windows with windows that would match the existing light pattern. Burnett asked what type of window was being proposed. The applicant stated that he was proposing a wood window with an aluminum exterior. Wolfe asked if the windows would be simulated divided light. The applicant said yes. Wolfe asked if the windows would be 12 over 12 to match the existing. The applicant said yes. Macknally verified that the trim would match as well.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to have the applicant return to the LHAC for approval.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII. ~~Name: Mr. Willie Oliver (Architect)~~
~~Site Address: 3624 Norwood Boulevard~~
~~District: Norwood Local Historic District~~
~~Requesting approval for: Addition to rear of existing home~~

Statements: This item was removed from the agenda.

IX. **Name: Mr. & Mrs. Melvin Collier (Homeowners)**
****Site Address:** 1401 16th Avenue South**
****District:** Phelan Park Local Historic District**
****Requesting approval for:** Replace a rock retaining wall with a new concrete retaining wall**

Statements: Mauk asked Perry if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that this project was approved with conditions by the Five Points South Neighborhood Association.

On November 16, 2021, the Neighborhood Association reviewed plans for the property located at 1401 16th Ave South and the following action was taken: Approve with conditions.

The recommendation of the Neighborhood Association was to support the design review request for the following reasons: An engineered reinforced concrete retaining wall is needed to repair/replace the collapsing wall.

The Neighborhood Association also cited public safety and adapting solutions to modern stronger materials.

The Neighborhood Association voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request: Apply stone and/or brick as a veneer.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

The applicant presented her plan to replace the deteriorated retaining wall in front of her home. She stated that one wall would be poured-in-place concrete, with a stone façade to match her home.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the Neighborhood Association, with a stone façade

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

X. Name: Mr. Richard Carnaggio

Site Address: 1810-1812 and 1814-1816 3rd Avenue North

District: 19th Street North

Requesting approval for: Historic Tax Credit funded renovation into all residential apartment building

Statements: Mr. Carnaggio presented his plan to renovate two historic buildings. He stated that he would be replacing all the windows in the buildings, and would be repairing the cornices and other architectural details. Burnett asked if all the repairs had National Park Service approval. Mr. Carnaggio said yes. Hoskins asked if the new windows were insulated or single pane. Mr. Carnaggio stated that they would be insulated. Wieseman asked if the green would only be on the rear of the building. Mr. Carnaggio said yes. Wieseman verified that Mr. Carnaggio would return with signage.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as submitted.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried. Burnett recused himself.

XI. Name: Mr. Roman Gary (CCR ARCHITECTURE & INTERIORS)

Site Address: 2250 Bessemer Road

District: Five Points West

Requesting approval for: New Construction / Demolition

Statements: Mr. Gary presented his plan to demolish an existing building, and build a



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

new one in Five Points West. He stated that signage and landscaping would return at a later date. Mr. Gary stated that the existing building was deteriorated, and needed to be demolished. He stated that the new building would be pushed out to the street, with the parking lot behind it. He also stated that he was proposing a tower element on the corner with 5 Points West branding. He stated that the materials on the building would be brick, stucco and dark bronze anodized aluminum. Hoskins asked if there was a rooftop patio. Mr. Gary said no. He stated that the railing on the roof was just decorative, and that there would not be any roof access. Wieseman asked if there would be access to the building from the street. Mr. Gary said no, that the only access would be from the parking lot. Montgomery-Mills verified that the windows facing Bessemer Road were clear. Montgomery-Mills stated that more information was needed for a final approval, but that the concept plan could be approved.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the demolition of the existing building and the conceptual plan for the new building, as presented. Mr. Gary will need to return with more information for final approval of the building, and approval of the landscaping and signage.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried. Burnett recused himself.

XII.

Name: Mr. Kirk Tyree

Site Address: 409 Richard Arrington Jr. Boulevard North

District: 21st Street North

Requesting approval for: Painting

Statements: Mr. Tyree presented his plan for a new paint scheme for a new children's center. He proposed to paint the wrought iron a matte black color and trim and area around the window to the left would be a light blue color and the front door would be yellow. Macknally asked if the applicant had a color rendering. He said no. Burnett verified that the door would be the only thing to be painted yellow. Macknally stated that the new design was very busy. Mr. Tyree stated that the owner wanted to brighten up the exterior for the users of the space.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to table this case, pending more information or other color scheme options.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

XIII. Name: Mr. Don Hawes
Site Address: 2817 6th Avenue South
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Mr. Hawes presented his plan for additional signage for a church. He stated that two churches were combining into one, so the second church signage needed to be added. Mauk asked if the signage fit within the Guidelines. Sims said that he wasn't sure, and that Zoning would still need to approve the signage. Mauk asked if the signage was lit. Mr. Hawes said no.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this signage contingent upon Zoning approval. She stated that if the signage needed to be reduced, it should still be centered above the window, as it is currently shown.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

XIV. Name: Mr. Joel Blackstock
Site Address: 2026 9th Avenue South
District: Midtown
Requesting approval for: Demolition / New Building Proposal

Statements: Mr. Blackstock presented his plan to demolish Quinlan Castle. Mr. Coleman stated that he didn't want to demolish Quinlan Castle, but that it is a structurally unsafe building, and needed to come down. He also stated that Southern Research wanted to take the property where Quinlan Castle is located, and build a new biomedical research building. Mr. Coleman also stated that two structural reports were completed and both showed how fragile and unsafe the building currently is. Mr. Blackstock stated that while Quinlan Castle is a historic building, it is economically and logistically not feasible for the building to be renovated to comply with modern regulations. He also stated that the building is not ADA compliant. Hoskins asked if there was any reason to keep the building. Mr. Blackstock stated that there wasn't, in his opinion. Burnett asked if there was a LHAC that met to discuss this build. Sims said there was not (the property is not located in a local historic district).

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve the demolition of this building based solely on the structural report of the building.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: Wolfe asked if there was a Perpetual Façade Easement for this building,



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Mauk asked if it was recorded. Mr. Gary stated that there wasn't in the title report, and that it wasn't recorded. Burnett stated that his motion was not based on any type of historical value that the building had. Macknally asked when the conceptual plan would be presented. Mauk stated that the concept would need to be approved within 6 months. Macknally asked what the timeframe for build-out was. Mr. Coleman said as soon as possible. Mauk stated that he sat on a Board for the City that approved funding for Southern Research about 10 years ago, but that he didn't receive any compensation for his service.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- XV. Name:** Ms. Patrice Blankenship
Site Address: 1725 3rd Avenue North
District: Birmingham Green
Requesting approval for: Signage / New Windows

Statements: The applicant was not present, therefore the case was not heard.

- XVI. Name:** Mr. Scott Fujino (Stratus)
Site Address: 701 32nd Street South (PNC Bank)
District: Lakeview
Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: The applicant presented his plan to change the signage from BBVA Compass to PNC Bank at their campus. Mauk asked if any signage size would be changed. The applicant said no. Mauk asked if the color would change. The applicant said yes, that the color would match PNC's branding. He stated that the signs would be 1 for 1 change outs. Burnett asked if there would be any new signs. The applicant said no. The applicant stated that the branding was all that would be change. Hoskins asked if the signage fit within the Guidelines and asked if the signage square footage increased. Sims said it fit within the Guidelines, and that the square footage did not increase.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Barnes

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- XVII. Name:** Mr. Christopher Baggett
Site Address: 1608 10th Avenue North
District: Cultural



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
November 17, 2021

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Requesting approval for: Fence and ramp

Statements: Mr. Baggett presented his plan to add a ramp and a black vinyl coated chain link fence around their loading dock. He stated that the new fence would have a 10' slide gate. Macknally asked if that was their parking lot adjacent to the loading dock. Mr. Baggett said yes.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

Burnett made a motion that the meeting be adjourned. Wolfe seconded. The motion carried. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:40 a.m.