



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**April 27, 2022**

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate. In addition, please note that prior to obtaining any permit(s), all applicants must meet with Zoning staff to determine compliance with the Zoning regulations. Design Review approval does NOT mean that Zoning has approved the request.

---

**Members Present:** Abra Barnes, Ivan Holloway, Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Brian Wolfe

**Members Absent:** Scott Burnett, Creig Hoskins, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain, Ben Wieseman

**Staff Present:** Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, Pamela Perry, John Sims

**Others Present:** James Browning, Richard Carnaggio, Robert Emerick, Kathryn Gardiner, Dan Gardner, Sutherland Hastings, Mark Martin, Sandy Miller, Melinda Sellers, Michael Shows, Blake Yarbrough

**Call to Order:** The meeting was called to order at 7:40 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 4/13/22 meeting were ready. Macknally made a motion to approve the minutes. Barnes seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. Robert Emerick (REV Birmingham)  
**Site Address:** 5505 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue North (Woodlawn Bar and Lounge)  
**District:** Woodlawn  
**Requesting approval for:** Signage

**Statements:** Mr. Emerick presented his plan to put new signage up at the Woodlawn Bar and Lounge. He stated that the new signage would be white vinyl lettering on the windows and doors. Mr. Emerick stated that the signage fit within the Zoning Guidelines. Montgomery-Mills asked what was written below the logo. Mr. Emerick stated that it was operating hours and dress code information. Barnes asked if the



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**April 27, 2022**

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

signage fit within the Guidelines. Sims said yes.

**Motion:** Barnes made a motion to approve as presented.

**Motion seconded by:** Holloway

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Mr. Richard Carnaggio / Mr. Don Hawes  
**Site Address:** 1927 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue North (Woodward Building)  
**District:** Birmingham Green  
**Requesting approval for:** Master Signage Plan (Last seen 4/13/22)

**Statements:** Mr. Hawes presented his master signage plan for the Total on 1<sup>st</sup>. He stated that he reduced his parking signage from 3 signs to 1 sign. Mr. Hawes also presented his blade sign. He stated that the blade sign was reduced from 11 square feet to 8 square feet. Mr. Carnaggio stated that the flat signs mounted onto the building would be a light bronze to be more sophisticated and not provide such a contrast as darker letters. Mauk asked if the signage was illuminated. Mr. Carnaggio stated that the blade sign was the only one that would be lit. Wolfe asked if the signage fit within the Guidelines. Sims said yes.

**Motion:** Wolfe made a motion to approve as presented.

**Motion seconded by:** Montgomery-Mills

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- III. Name:** Mr. James Browning  
**Site Address:** 2937 7th Avenue South  
**District:** Lakeview  
**Requesting approval for:** Master Signage Plan / Renovation (Last seen 3/23/22)

**Statements:** Mr. Browning presented his master signage plan for the Pappas Building. He stated that he would only be adding one new sign to the building on the second floor. He stated that the new sign would be peel and stick lettering on the new siding that was previously approved. Macknally asked if the building had multiple tenants. Mr. Browning said yes, but that the second floor was all the same tenant. Macknally verified that there wouldn't be any additional signage on the building. He stated that the



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**April 27, 2022**

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

monument sign would remain unchanged.

**Motion:** Wolfe made a motion to carry this case over, pending a master signage plan.

**Motion seconded by:** Holloway

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried

**IV.**

**Name:** Mr. Mark Martin (Contractor)

**Site Address:** 1222 29<sup>th</sup> Street North

**District:** Norwood Local Historic District

**Requesting approval for:** Replacing and repairing windows; replacing siding over the entire home; adding rear dormers for the bedrooms; replacing roof; and painting the exterior (Last seen 1/12/22)

**Statements:** Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that the project was approved with conditions, and the applicant has agreed to the conditions.

On 4/20/22, the LHAC of the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1222 29<sup>th</sup> Street North, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the LHAC was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Page 15: Materials – Use of alternative materials is approved with the exception of vinyl. Hardieboard is an approved material.

Page 18: Roofs – Roofing materials are of approved design and material.

Page 22: II A. Additions – Locate additions so they will not obscure or damage significant architectural features, ornament or detail.

The LHAC also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

Page 19: Windows - Applicant states that window size will be slightly altered to be as close to the original sizing without being a special-order window due to current pandemic-related supply issues. This is being allowed as long as the window proportions are in keeping with the original. "Where window replacement is unavoidable...new frame units are to match the original window in terms of material,



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**April 27, 2022**

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

style, light pattern, construction, and proportion.”

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Martin stated that he was renovating the whole house and would be adding a dormer to the rear of the home. Mr. Martin stated that he would be replacing the windows in the home, and the new windows would be wood windows. He stated that the windows would be 2-over-2, and would be slightly smaller than what is there now. Mr. Martin stated that he would be replacing the vinyl siding with hardie board.

**Motion:** Barnes made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

**Motion seconded by:** Holloway

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- V. **Name:** Mr. Gabriel Hastings (Homeowner)  
**Site Address:** 3810 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue South  
**District:** Avondale Park Local Historic District  
**Requesting approval for:** New construction

**Statements:** Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Perry stated that this proposal was approved with conditions, and the applicant has agreed to the condition.

On 4/19/22, the LHAC of the Avondale Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3810 6<sup>th</sup> Ave. S, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the LHAC was to approve with conditions the design review



## City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes April 27, 2022

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

request for the following reasons: The applicant's plan is approved as presented with conditions: 1) Flooring material – tongue and groove. 2) Raise the rough opening for the front windows to 7'4". 3) T111 to be used as material for the soffits.

The recommendation of the LHAC was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines: #1, 2, 3, and 4.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Hastings stated that he bought an empty lot and wanted to build a new home on the lot. He stated that he wanted the new home to fit into the existing neighborhood. He stated that he agreed to adjust the windows per the LHAC recommendation. Mr. Hastings also stated that he agreed to change the soffits to tongue and groove. He agreed to change the height of the top of the windows as well. He stated that the driveway would come off the back alley.

**Motion:** Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

**Motion seconded by:** Montgomery-Mills

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

**VI. Name:** Mr. Grover Burns (Homeowner)

**Site Address:** 580 Rutherford Circle

**District:** Roebuck Springs Local Historic District

**Requesting approval for:** Replacing damaged fascia boards and soffits; painting the brick and all wood surfaces



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**April 27, 2022**

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

**Statements:** The applicant was not present; therefore the case was not heard.

- VII. Name:** Ms. Kat Gardiner / Ms. Stephanie Metzler (National Park Service)  
**Site Address:** 1528 5th Avenue North  
**District:** Downtown Northwest  
**Requesting approval for:** Signage

**Statements:** Ms. Gardiner presented her plan to add a new sign near the AG Gaston motel in the 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue District. She stated that the sign would be 4' tall and 3' wide, and would be double-sided. She stated that it would be an informational sign about the A.G. Gaston motel and the Civil Rights District. Macknally asked what the material of the sign would be. Ms. Gardiner stated that it would be powder-coated aluminum, with a concrete base.

**Motion:** Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

**Motion seconded by:** Holloway

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- VIII. Name:** Mr. Patrick Chatman  
**Site Address:** 2250 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue North  
**District:** Cultural  
**Requesting approval for:** New Roll-Up Door (Last seen 4/13/22)

**Statements:** Mr. Gardiner presented his plan to add a roll up door to a new Jazz Club. Montgomery-Mills proposed to move the door over to the left by one bay to improve traffic flow. Wolfe verified that the storefront and windows would match the existing.

**Motion:** Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

**Motion seconded by:** Holloway

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

- IX. Name:** Ms. Melinda Sellers  
**Site Address:** 1700 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue South  
**District:** Midtown  
**Requesting approval for:** Temporary parking lot (last seen 1/26/22)



**City of Birmingham Design Review Committee**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**April 27, 2022**

**Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.**

**Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, City Hall**

---

**Statements:** Mr. Yarbrough presented his plan to improve a vacant lot into a temporary surface parking lot. He stated that the lot would be gravel and would have landscaping around the perimeter of the lot. He stated that he would have wheel stops and irrigation for the landscaping. Macknally asked what the plant material would be. Mr. Yarbrough stated that the shrubs would be Needlepoint Hollies. Macknally asked if a temporary lot needed to have a tree canopy. Havard stated that it was up to the Committee's discretion. The applicant stated that she wanted the lot to return within 3-4 years with a development plan. Macknally verified that the only vehicular access to the site would be from the alley. Macknally also verified that there would be no work in the ROW at this time. Macknally asked what size the needlepoint hollies would be. The applicant stated that they would be 7-gallon size. Wolfe asked if there was any signage. Ms. Sellers stated that she would need to return with signage at a later date.

**Motion:** Macknally to approve on condition. 1. plant material needs to be a minimum of 7-gallon size, 2. RPZ needs to be screened and within the property line, 3. project needs to come back within three years otherwise the site needs to come into compliance, 4. signage needs to return.

**Motion seconded by:** Wolfe

**Discussion:** none

**Vote:** The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, Wolfe made a motion to adjourn. Macknally seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 8:20 a.m.