



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate. In addition, please note that prior to obtaining any permit(s), all applicants must meet with Zoning staff to determine compliance with the Zoning regulations. Design Review approval does NOT mean that Zoning has approved the request.

Members Present: Lea Ann Macknally, Richard Mauk, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Abra Barnes, Scott Burnett, Ivan Holloway, Creig Hoskins, Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, John Sims

Others Present: Louis Aller, James Browning, Paul Carus, Tamm Carus, Robert Emerick, Kurtis Hammond, Sam Lindee, Marbury McCullough, Gregory Rankins, Robert Thompson

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 6/22/2022 meeting were ready. Macknally made a motion to approve the minutes. Wieseman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I.** Name: Mr. Louis Aller (Owner)
Site Address: 2920 Norwood Boulevard
District: Norwood Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: New home construction

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On June 13, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 2920 Norwood Blvd., and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 22-Item B-Architectural Style *“The street facade is visually significant to the historic character of a street. New construction should employ facade designs that are architecturally compatible with existing historic structures. So that they appear to be congruous with the majority of the houses within the neighborhood, infill houses shall be similar in architectural design and character to a style represented among the district’s contributing housing stock that was constructed during the first four decades of the twentieth century. New construction should reference predominant design characteristics that make the area distinctive, while still reflecting creative design solutions that are more than just mere imitations of existing buildings. In terms of materials and craftsmanship, infill houses shall be of a quality comparable to Norwood’s original homes.”* See conditions below

Page 23-Item E-Decks *“Decks are not appropriate at the front or side of the house.”*

Page 23-Item F-Doors *“Doors shall conform to the style of the house and shall be of wood or composite materials.”*

Page 24-Item I-Foundations *“Appropriate (based on the period & design of the house): - Brick -Stuccoed or bricked concrete block -Stone”* See conditions below.

Page 25-Item K-Gutters and Downspouts *“The size and profile of gutters and downspouts shall be appropriate to the house. Gutters and downspouts shall be painted to blend with other trim on the building.”*

Page 26-Item M-Materials *“The primary form of construction in Norwood is wood frame and the exterior wall materials include simple weatherboard, brick veneer, stucco and wood shingles. New construction projects and additions should use one of these traditional building materials, similar in size and physical appearance to the established construction.”* See conditions below.

Page 26-Item N-Paint *“Colors shall be compatible with the style of the house being represented.”*

Page 28-Item R-Roofs *“In Norwood, roofing materials primarily include asphalt shingles, terra cotta clay tiles and concrete shingles. Roof materials on any permanent structure shall be historically accurate or shall appear to be historically accurate based on the architectural style being represented.”*

Page 28-Item S-Size, Scale, Massing, Orientation and Setback *“In terms of size, scale, massing, orientation and setback, in-fill houses and additions shall conform to and be consistent with dominant patterns of size scale, massing orientation and setback of the existing historic and immediately surrounding housing stock within the district and shall*



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

be in compliance with the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Birmingham.” See conditions below.

Page 31-Item V-Windows *“Wood windows or metal clad wood windows with true divided lights or simulated divided lights are acceptable.”*

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines:

Page 22-Item B-Architectural Style

Page 23-Item E-Decks

Page 23-Item F-Doors

Page 24-Item I-Foundations

Page 25-Item K-Gutters and Downspouts

Page 26-Item M-Materials

Page 26-Item N-Paint

Page 27-Item Q-Retaining Walls

Page 28-Item R-Roofs

Page 28-Item S-Size, Scale, Massing, Orientation and Setback

Page 31-Item V-Windows

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

1. Trim and detailing shall be done in such a way so that the craftsmanship is comparable to Norwood’s original homes.
2. Applicant has stated that the foundation will be constructed from poured concrete. Should the method of construction change to concrete block rather than poured concrete, please note that the concrete block must be either parged/stuccoed or clad in an approved material.
3. Siding is approved, but should be installed so that the exposure size is similar to existing historic houses in the area.
4. Please ensure that all local zoning requirements have been met. The provided site plan shows a setback that is not in compliance with local zoning, applicant has stated that he will increase the setback to a distance that is conforming to the zoning ordinance.

The LHAC also made the following findings:



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Aller presented his plan to build a new home in Norwood. Mr. Aller stated that he agreed to all the conditions set forth by the LHAC.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

II. Name: Mr. Kurtis Hammond (KD Hammond Construction)

Site Address: 22 Norwood Circle

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Replacing windows, repairing rear deck, and painting trim and eaves (Carried over from the 6/22/2022 DRC meeting)

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On June 13, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 22 Norwood Cir., and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 12-Item C-Decks *“Decks are not appropriate at the front or side of the house.”*
Proposed deck is located at the rear of the house, which conforms to the guidelines.

Page 13-Item E-Doors *“Original doors, frames, hardware and glass shall be retained*



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

and maintained where possible since original doors help to define a house's architectural style and therefore are of great importance to the preservation of a historic structure. Repair in accordance with the original design is preferred over replacement. When repair of original doors, frames, hardware and glass is not possible due to extreme deterioration, replacements should match the original design or be consistent with the architectural style of the home." See conditions below.

Page 14-Item H-Foundations *"In Norwood, foundations typically are continuous brick or brick piers. Original foundation materials shall be maintained and repaired when necessary." See conditions below.*

Page 15-Item K-Materials *"Alternative materials shall not be used unless such materials visually replicate the original exterior in appearance, dimensions, texture, etc. to every degree possible." See conditions below.*

Page 16-Item L-Paint *"Colors shall be compatible with the age and style of the house. Previously unpainted brick shall not be painted except in cases where repair has been so extensive as to be visually distracting."*

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary) *"Maintain the historic design and character or existing porch structures. Deteriorated frame porch elements shall be repaired where needed. If replacement is necessary, it shall be with matching wood pieces or other matching materials."*

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative) *"All historic trim shall be repaired and maintained. Any elements of the trim which become deteriorated shall be repaired or replaced with new pieces that match the original design and proportions." See conditions below.*

Page 19-Item U-Windows *"The windows of a historic home are an important feature of the home's architecture. For that reason, every effort should be made to preserve and maintain original windows, including the original opening, window frame and sash. Replacement of entire windows shall be discouraged. However, where window replacement is unavoidable because of deterioration, new frame units are to match the original window in terms of material, style, light pattern (design), construction and proportions."*

See conditions below.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Page 12-Item C-Decks

Page 13-Item E-Doors



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Page 14-Item H-Foundations

Page 15-Item K-Materials

Page 16-Item L-Paint

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary)

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative)

Page 19-Item U-Windows

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

1. Proposed French doors would change the size of the original opening and cannot be approved. Applicant should submit a new front door that matches the original door size and is appropriate to the style of the house.
2. Applicant has requested to eliminate one upstairs window and to change the sill height on the triple window on the "Right Elevation". The committee agreed that the upstairs double window can be reduced to a single window by eliminating the window on the left of the double window. The committee also agreed that the triple window downstairs can be modified by raising the sill height as long as the new sill aligns with the existing smaller window immediately adjacent to the triple window. All brick that will need to be sourced for the patching or foundation repair must match the original as closely as possible in size, color, texture, etc.
3. Should any of the existing trim need to be repaired new trim shall match the original.
4. From the exterior it appeared to committee members that there were definitely 3 windows that were in a state that is beyond repair, 2 additional windows appeared they may need to be replaced, but it was hard to be certain. The remaining windows appeared to be in good condition and should be able to be reglazed and painted in order to preserve and maintain the original windows. Where replacement is unavoidable, the submitted window can be approved assuming the size and configuration matches the originals.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Hammond presented his plan to replace windows, paint trim and repair the deck of a home in Norwood. Mr. Hammond stated that he agreed to all the conditions set forth by the LHAC. Mr. Hammond stated that he wanted to replace all the windows on the home, not just some of them.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

III.

Name: Mr. Paul Carus (Owner)

Site Address: 2939 Berwick Road

District: Red Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: New Residential Construction

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On 7/22/2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Red Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 2939 Berwick Road, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

The proposal is a creative solution to building sensitively on a topographically difficult lot.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

III. 1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, or site and its environment, or to use a property for its originally intended purpose.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

III. 3 All buildings, structures, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations should be compatible with the existing and/or surrounding properties.

III. 10 All new constructions shall respect the historic character of the district and the street. No new construction shall have a detrimental impact on the historic nature of the district on which its significance is based. The style of new construction is not required to replicate construction typical of the district's significance, but materials shall be compatible in selection and permanence. Massing and setbacks shall be consistent with those of the immediate surrounding properties and applicable zoning ordinances. No multi-family or multi-story (over 3 levels above ground) development will be permitted that is inconsistent with zoning codes. Site plans for new construction shall be sensitive to and compatible with adjacent properties and structures and minimize changes to natural site topography.

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

That the design meets ZBA approval.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Carus stated that he wanted to build a new home in Redmont. Mauk asked what materials would be used. Mr. Carus stated that the home would be Corten steel and painted steel and poured in place concrete. The applicant also presented her colors for the home. Wieseman asked what the color green that they were using was called. The applicant stated that it was called "Dark Forest Green." Macknally verified that there would be no grading on the site.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Macknally



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- IV. ~~**Name:** Mr. John Forney (Architect)
Site Address: 3809 5th Avenue South
District: Avondale Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: New duplex dwellings on vacant site~~

Statements: This item was removed from the agenda.

- V. **Name:** Mr. Robert Thompson (Thompson Architecture Inc.)
Site Address: 321 19th Street Ensley (Bethesda Building)
District: Ensley
Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. Thompson stated that the front façade will be updated, and the windows will be reglazed. He stated that the exterior will be repainted. The paint color will be French Gray. Mr. Thompson stated that the mural would remain. He also stated that the new main entrance would face the parking lot instead of the street. Wieseman stated that the door on the front of the building is historically significant and stated that having only windows on the front doesn't honor the historic nature of the building. Mr. Thompson stated that he would return for signage if needed.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Macknally – approved, but need to return with streetscape elements, lighting and signage.

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried, Wieseman voted against.

- VI. **Name:** Mr. Gregory Rankins
Site Address: 2879 Norwood Boulevard
District: Norwood
Requesting approval for: replacing vinyl siding with hardie, painting the exterior, replacing front and back door, replacing the roof

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Havard stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On July 18, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 2879 Norwood Blvd, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions. The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 13-Item E-Doors *“When repair of original doors, frames, hardware, and glass is not possible due to extreme deterioration, replacements should match the original design or be consistent with the architectural style of the home. See conditions below.*

Page 15-Item K-Materials *“Alternative materials shall not be used unless such materials visually replicate the original exterior in appearance, dimensions, texture, etc. to every degree possible.” See conditions below.*

Page 16-Item L-Paint *“Colors shall be compatible with the age and style of the house. Previously unpainted brick shall not be painted except in cases where repair has been so extensive as to be visually distracting.” See conditions below.*

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary) *“Maintain the historic design and character or existing porch structures. Deteriorated frame porch elements shall be repaired where needed. If replacement is necessary, it shall be with matching wood pieces or other matching materials.”*

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs *“When replacement of the existing roof materials is necessary due to deterioration, roof materials on any permanent structure shall be historically accurate or shall appear to be historically accurate based on the original materials and architectural style of the house. A porch roof shall match the materials of the house roof proper except in the interest of preserving historical materials original to the home.”*
Asphalt shingles are an approved material

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative) *“All historic trim shall be repaired and maintained. Any elements of the trim which become deteriorated shall be repaired or replaced with new pieces that match the original design and proportions.”*

See conditions below.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines:

Page 13-Item E-Doors

Page 15-Item K-Materials

Page 16-Item L-Paint

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary)



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative)

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

1. Photo of the proposed replacement front door was not included in the original submission. Applicant provided a photo of a replacement door during the meeting with the committee, this door is of a style that is consistent with the architectural style of the home. Door is approved on the condition that the door is submitted to the city for record and that the submitted door matches what was shown to the committee on site.
2. Siding is approved on the condition that it matches the exposure and appearance of the original siding.
3. Because the house was previously covered in vinyl siding the committee was not able to determine whether any of the historic trim details as shown in the historic photo are present. If any historic trim is uncovered it should be maintained. If trim needs to be replaced it shall be done with trim to match the original.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Rankins stated that he agreed with the conditions set forth by the LHAC. Mr. Rankins stated that he wanted to replace the vinyl siding with hardie board siding. He also stated that he wanted to replace the front door with a new stained wood front door. He stated that he wanted to paint the exterior of the home "Origami White." Macknally asked what color the trim would be. Mr. Rankins stated that it would be Gauntlet Gray.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as submitted, in agreement with the LHAC.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 27, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Motion seconded by: Macknally

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VII. Name: Mr. James Browning

Site Address: 2937 7th Avenue South

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Master Signage Plan

Statements: Mr. Browning presented his master signage plan. He stated that there would only be two new signs added to the building. He stated that the signs would be stainless steel, with stencils. Wieseman asked if there was any lighting. Mr. Browning stated that they weren't making any changes to the lighting. Macknally asked if the signage met the Guidelines. Sims stated that the signage met the Guidelines.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve the master signage plan, not including the monument sign.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII. Name: Mr. Robert Emerick (REV Birmingham)

Site Address: 5530 1st Avenue North

District: Woodlawn

Requesting approval for: Master Signage Plan Revision

Statements: Mr. Emerick presented his revisions to the master signage plan for this building. He stated that existing signage would be moved to the corner of the building, and that a painted sign would be added to the building. Mr. Emerick stated that the blade sign would remain. Mauk asked if this proposal fit within the Guidelines. Sims stated that it did.

Motion: Macknally made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, Macknally made a motion to adjourn. Wolfe seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 8:10 a.m.