



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate. In addition, please note that prior to obtaining any permit(s), all applicants must meet with Zoning staff to determine compliance with the Zoning regulations. Design Review approval does NOT mean that Zoning has approved the request.

Members Present: Scott Burnett, Ivan Holloway, Creig Hoskins, Richard Mauk, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Abra Barnes, Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, John Sims

Others Present: Eric Buchannon, Wes Daniel, Rebecca Dobrinski, Meighan Ellis, Tamera Erskine, Roman Gary, Robert Lipsey, Michael Lovejoy, Trevor Matchett, Debora Mayes, Joe McCoy, Derek Needham, Nick Norris, Bill Segrest

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 7/27/22 and 8/10/22 meeting were ready. Wieseman made a motion to approve the minutes. Holloway seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. Robert Lipsey III (Owner)
Site Address: 626 47th Street South
District: Avondale Park Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Painting brick on side porch

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved as presented.

On August 15, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Avondale Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 626 47th Street S, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Lipsey presented his plan to paint previously unpainted brick on the side porch of his home. He stated that the rest of the home had already been painted. Wieseman asked what color the porch would be painted. Mr. Lipsey stated that it would be painted "Mahogany." Hoskins asked if the side porch could be seen from the street. Mr. Lipsey said that it could if you stand at the edge of the sidewalk and look down.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC, since all the other brick on the home had already been painted, and the porch would be painted to match the rest of the house. Wieseman stated that this case was approved because the request fit within the Guidelines of the district. The Avondale design guidelines do not directly address or prohibit painting of brick.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

II. Name: Mr. Nicholas Norris (Southern Solutions)

Site Address: 3809 4th Avenue South

District: Avondale Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Installing vinyl replacement windows and wooden front door

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On August 15, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Avondale Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3809 4th Avenue S, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Applicant's plan is recommended as presented with the following conditions: 1. Window replacement on the front of the house to be wooden clad one over one sashes and 2. The front door replacement is to be wooden, 3/4 light.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Norris presented his plan to replace the windows and the front door of the home. Mauk verified that the applicant would be complying with the LHAC's recommendations. Wolfe verified that the applicant would be using wood windows on the front of the home. Wieseman verified the color that the applicant intended to use. The applicant confirmed that he would be using "High-reflective White." Wieseman also verified that all the replacement trim would match.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

III. Name: Mr. Eric Buchannon (Year Round Painting & Pressure Washing)

Site Address: 3234 Norwood Boulevard

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Painting brick on existing home

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On August 15, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3234 Norwood Blvd., and the Committee took the following action: Deny.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Deny the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 16-Item L-Paint *“Colors shall be compatible with the age and style of the house. Previously unpainted brick shall not be painted except in cases where repair has been so extensive as to be visually distracting. Previously painted brick and stone may be repainted.”* It was the recommendation of the committee that none of the previously unpainted brick shall be painted. “Because a small portion of the porch brick has previously been painted in a manner that is distracting to the overall character of the home, the committee’s suggestion is only the brick on the porch structure should be painted in a color that closely matches the color of the unpainted brick on the remainder of the home. Applicant should use a paint made specifically for masonry applications. Any previously painted brick accents can be repainted in a different color if the applicant so chooses.”

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines:

Page 16-Item L-Paint

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Does not Conform to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is not compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Buchanan presented his plan to paint previously unpainted brick on the home. Burnett verified that this home is a contributing structure to the neighborhood. Mr.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Buchanan stated that other homes in the vicinity of this one had already been painted. It was not known if those houses were painted prior to the local historic district designation, or if the work was done without DRC review and approval. Wieseman pointed out brick repair work that had been done on the home.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to deny this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: The homeowner spoke to the DRC, explaining that other houses in the neighborhood had already been painted. She stated that she was just trying to go through the permitting process the right way. Wieseman advised her to work with the LHAC to identify options.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IV. Name: Mr. Stephen Sanders Jr. (SH Global Investment, LLC)

Site Address: 1305 31st Street North

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Installing replacement windows, new exterior siding, new driveway and walkway, and new doors; Repairing fascia and soffits; Repairing front porch floor; Installing new roof shingles; and Painting

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On August 15, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1305 31st St. N, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 12-Item C-Decks *“Decks are not appropriate at the front or side of the house.”* See conditions below.

Page 13-Item E-Doors *“When repair of original doors, frames, hardware, and glass is not possible due to extreme deterioration, replacements should match the original design or be consistent with the architectural style of the home.”* See conditions below.

Page 13-Item F-Driveways *“Install residential driveways in a manner and width compatible with those historically installed, generally not wider than ten feet and also in compliance with the City’s Zoning Ordinance. Locate driveways to the side and rear of the main building. Extend all driveways to at least the rear of the main building.”* See conditions below.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Page 15-Item K-Materials *“Alternative materials shall not be used unless such materials visually replicate the original exterior in appearance, dimensions, texture, etc. to every degree possible.”* See conditions below.

Page 16-Item L-Paint *“Colors shall be compatible with the age and style of the house. Previously painted brick and stone may be repainted.”*

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary) *“Maintain the historic design and character or existing porch structures. Deteriorated frame porch elements shall be repaired where needed. If replacement is necessary, it shall be with matching wood pieces or other matching materials.”*

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs *“When replacement of the existing roof materials is necessary due to deterioration, roof materials on any permanent structure shall be historically accurate or shall appear to be historically accurate based on the original materials and architectural style of the house. A porch roof shall match the materials of the house roof proper except in the interest of preserving historical materials original to the home.”*
Asphalt shingles are an approved material

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative) *“All historic trim shall be repaired and maintained. Any elements of the trim which become deteriorated shall be repaired or replaced with new pieces that match the original design and proportions.”*

Page 19-Item U-Windows *“The windows of a historic home are an important feature of the home’s architecture. For that reason, every effort should be made to preserve and maintain original windows, including the original opening, window frame and sash.”*
See conditions below.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines:

Page 12-Item C-Decks

Page 13-Item E-Doors

Page 13-Item F-Driveways

Page 15-Item K-Materials

Page 16-Item L-Paint

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary)

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative)

Page 19-Item U-Windows

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

conditions be placed upon this request:

1. Applicant has proposed to repair the existing deck located on the side of the house. Because the deck is an existing structure it can remain in place and be repaired as needed.
2. The proposed door is an acceptable design, if applicant is not able to source the proposed door due to supply chain issues a similar craftsman style door can be used.
3. Driveway should extend to at least the back of the house.
4. Due to the fact that the house is currently covered in aluminum siding the committee was not able to see what original materials remain intact underneath. The applicant's proposal is to restore the exterior siding and trim to what is shown in the historic photograph. Committee approves of this plan and asks that any salvageable material that is found under the aluminum siding is maintained.
5. Window sizing and configuration as shown in the window schedule and on the elevations does not appear to match the historic photographs. Any existing windows that remain in the home shall be repaired and kept in place. If the attic windows are in place underneath the aluminum siding, applicant should every effort to keep and repair these windows. Windows appear to be a 9 over 1 configuration for the double/single hung units upstairs and a 9 lite for the fixed units upstairs. Any necessary replacement windows should be of this configuration and should match the original window opening size.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: does not Conform to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is not compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Sanders presented his renovation plans. Wolfe asked what was behind the aluminum siding. Mr. Sanders stated that it appeared to be wood. Mr. Sanders stated



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

that he wanted to keep the wood siding, as much as possible. Burnett verified that the applicant agreed with the conditions of the LHAC. Mauk asked what colors the applicant intended to use. Wolfe stated that Behr “burnished pewter” and Behr “melted icicle” and Behr “roscoe beige” were called out in the drawings.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

V. **Name:** Mr. Michael Lovejoy (DEC Fire and Water Restoration)

Site Address: 1421 33rd Street North

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Painting of brick, soffit, and trim; Removing vinyl from soffit and trim and replacing it with pine wood; and Installing wood window trim

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On August 15, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1421 33rd St. N, and the Committee took the following action: Deny.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Deny the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 15-Item K-Materials *“Alternative materials shall not be used unless such materials visually replicate the original exterior in appearance, dimensions, texture, etc. to every degree possible. However, replacement or covering of original siding material with artificial siding such as aluminum or vinyl is prohibited.”* Prior to meeting with the Norwood Historic Advisory Committee the applicant installed vinyl over the porch ceiling and part of the soffits. Vinyl is not an approved material and it is the recommendation of the advisory committee that it be removed. Applicant stated during the meeting that the new soffit material proposed would be plywood. No historic photograph was provided during the review, but it was the opinion of the committee that a flat plywood product was probably not what was originally installed on the home. As an alternative, a ply-bead plywood product that replicates historic tongue and groove bead board can be used. If any original material remains underneath the vinyl and is in repairable condition, applicant should restore and keep the existing material.

Page 16-Item L-Paint *“Colors shall be compatible with the age and style of the house. Previously unpainted brick shall not be painted except in cases where repair has been so*



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

extensive as to be visually distracting. Previously painted brick and stone may be repainted.” House was partially painted at the time of the application prior to meeting with the Norwood Historic Advisory Committee. It is an unfortunate circumstance, but the committee does not feel that the paint can be removed without causing damage to the brick. For that reason the committee feels that the painting should be completed. Applicant needs to ensure that they are using a paint that is suitable for masonry applications.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following section of the local historic district’s design guidelines: Page 16-Item L-Paint.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Lovejoy presented his plan to paint the brick on the home. He stated that the front and the sides of the house have already been painted.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to deny the request, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: Wolfe asked if there had been some brick repair work done. The applicant stated that there had been some repair work done. The applicant stated that the homeowners bought the house after the repair work had already begun. Burnett advised the applicant to work with City Staff and the LHAC to reach a solution.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

Burnett left the room.

- VI. Name:** Mr. Joe McCoy
Site Address: 2250 Bessemer Road
District: 5 Points West



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Requesting approval for: New Construction (Last seen 11/17/21)

Statements: Mr. McCoy presented his case to build a new development in 5 Points West. Wolfe asked if signage would be presented. The applicant said no. Wieseman verified that the materials and plan remained the same from the conceptual approval.

Motion: Holloway made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

Burnett returned.

VII. Name: Ms. Meighan Ellis (Advance Sign & Lighting)

Site Address: 3201 3rd Avenue South

District: Lakeview

Requesting approval for: Signage

Statements: Ms. Ellis presented her plan to replace signage for a building. She stated that there were three signs that would be replaced. She stated that the letters would be 14" tall. Mauk verified that the signage fit within the Guidelines. Sims stated that this was a one for one sign replacement. Burnett asked if the monument sign was included in the scope. Ms. Ellis stated that she was not addressing the monument sign. She stated that she would be removing the monument sign.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve the proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Holloway

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VIII. Name: Mr. Trevor Matchett (Poole & Company Architects, LLC)

Site Address: 2410 Reverend Abraham Woods Jr. Boulevard

District: Cultural

Requesting approval for: Demolition

Statements: Mr. Matchett presented his plan to remove the former Salvation Army building in anticipation of a new development. Mauk asked what would go back in its place. Mr. Matchett stated that the parking lot would remain, and that the building site would be grassed. Mr. Matchett stated that there would be a future development in this area. Hoskins stated that generally the DRC is presented with a concept plan of what the future plans for the site will be, so that the site doesn't just become parking.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
August 24, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Motion: Burnett made a motion to carry this case over pending more information.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

IX. Name: Ms. Rachel Perry (WILLIAMS BLACKSTOCK ARCHITECTS)

Site Address: 1709/1711 1ST Avenue North

District: Downtown Northwest

Requesting approval for: Renovation /New Construction

Statements: The applicant presented his plan for The Hub. He stated that the comments from the National Park Service had been incorporated into the design. He also stated that signage would be a part of the package to be approved as well.

Wieseman asked if the signage met the Guidelines. Sims stated that the signage met the Guidelines. Wolfe verified that the additional signage would be painted in the building.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, on the condition that the dimensions for the location of the blade sign are corrected.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: Wolfe asked what the intent of the vinyl window graphics were. The applicant stated that the vinyl graphics were meant to mimic the historic hand painted signs for the area.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

The Committee discussed how it dealt with the cases of painting previously unpainted brick. Wolfe stated that it's important to recognize when people are asking for permission or forgiveness, and that the Committee needs to be as fair as possible when discussing these types of cases. Burnett stated that it wasn't DRC's responsibility to enforce the Guidelines. Holloway asked if there was an enforcement mechanism. Calvert stated that when cases of suspected violations (unpermitted and unapproved work) are reported, she regularly notifies the inspections staff so that they can investigate and issue stop work orders, if necessary. Burnett stated that paint can be removed from brick, but it just needs to be done carefully.

There being no further business, Wolfe made a motion to adjourn. Hoskins seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 8:25 a.m.