



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate. In addition, please note that prior to obtaining any permit(s), all applicants must meet with Zoning staff to determine compliance with the Zoning regulations. Design Review approval does NOT mean that Zoning has approved the request.

Members Present: Abra Barnes, Scott Burnett, Ivan Holloway, Creig Hoskins, Richard Mauk, Ben Wieseman, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, John Sims

Others Present: David Brandt, Justin Brown, Josh Denard, Rebecca Dobrinski, Meghan McCollum, Felecia Mearon, John Mills, Lecie Smith

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 9/14/22 meeting were ready. Hoskins made a motion to approve the minutes. Wieseman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Ms. Lecie Smith
Site Address: 1406 31st Street North
District: Norwood Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: Replacement windows

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On September 21, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1406 31st St. N, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 19-Item U-Windows

"The windows of a historic home are an important feature of the home's architecture. For that reason, every effort should be made to preserve and maintain original windows, including the original opening, window frame and sash.

Replacement of entire windows shall be discouraged. However, where window replacement is unavoidable because of deterioration, new frame units are to match the original window in terms of material, style, light pattern (design), construction and proportions."

See conditions below.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Page 19-Item U-Windows

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

Where replacement is unavoidable because of deterioration, the submitted window can be approved assuming the size and configuration will match the originals. Any existing original windows that are in repairable condition should be preserved and maintained.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Ms. Smith presented her proposal to replace the windows on her father's home. Hoskins verified that the new windows would have the same configuration as the existing windows. Wolfe asked if all the windows would be replaced. Ms. Smith stated that only



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

the broken or inoperable windows would be replaced.

Motion: Hoskins made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Wieseman

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

II.

Name: Mr. Josh Denard (MRHQ Roofs)

Site Address: 1228 28th Street North

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Installation of DECRA Villa Tile metal roofing

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved.

On September 21, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1228 28th St. N, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to approve the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs

“In Norwood, roofing materials primarily include asphalt shingles, terra cotta clay tiles and concrete shingles. Historic roof materials shall be repaired and maintained where possible.

When replacement of the existing roof materials is necessary due to deterioration, roof materials on any permanent structure shall be historically accurate or shall appear to be historically accurate based on the original materials and architectural style of the house.”

Proposed roofing material appears to be historically accurate to the original roof of the house based on the historic photo provided by applicant.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines:

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

established.

2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.

3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.

4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Denard presented his plan to replace the roof on a home in the Norwood neighborhood. He stated that the new roof would be metal and that he would be restoring the roof to its original appearance that resembled the concrete tile that originally was on the house. Wieseman verified that the color of the roof would be dark charcoal gray.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Burnett

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

III.

Name: Mr. Josh Denard (MRHQ Roofs)

Site Address: 3140 Norwood Boulevard

District: Norwood Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Installation of Diamond Metal roofing system to match the design of the original asbestos shingles

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved.

On September 21, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3140 Norwood Blvd., and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

“In Norwood, roofing materials primarily include asphalt shingles, terra cotta clay tiles and concrete shingles. Historic roof materials shall be repaired and maintained where possible.

When replacement of the existing roof materials is necessary due to deterioration, roof materials on any permanent structure shall be historically accurate or shall appear to be historically accurate based on the original materials and architectural style of the house.”

Committee was unable to tell definitively whether the original roofing material was asbestos tile or terra cotta tile from the provided historic photograph. However, based on the historic photographs of the closest surrounding houses, which clearly show diamond patterned tile roofing, the committee feels that the proposed roofing material is appropriate to the house and should be approved.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district’s design guidelines:

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Denard presented his proposal to replace the diamond shaped asbestos roof. He stated that the new shingles would be diamond-shaped as well. Hoskins asked if the roof would have clay tile caps. Mr. Denard said that it would since that’s how it looked historically.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Holloway

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

- IV. Name:** Ms. Felicia H. Mearon
Site Address: 705 19th Street Ensley
District: Ensley
Requesting approval for: Demolition

Statements: Ms. Mearon presented her proposal to demolish the two-story building in Ensley. Mauk asked if the building had a roof. Ms. Mearon stated that it did not. Burnett asked if the second story floor was still intact. Ms. Mearon stated that it was not. Sims stated that the City was in the process of condemning the building in the past. Hoskins asked if the brick would remain, or if they would be removed. Ms. Mearon stated that the bricks would be removed. Ms. Mearon stated that she wanted to replace this building with a smaller, one-story building within the next two years. Ms. Mearon stated that she wanted to demolish the building because it was dangerous to the public and could fall at any time.

Motion: Burnett made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted, because the building is a public nuisance and because a replacement building will go back in its place.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: Wieseman requested that staff make sure there is a massing diagram showing what will go back as the intended use for the new building.

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- V. Name:** Ms. Meghan McCollum (Blank Space Bham)
Site Address: 1820 7th Avenue North
District: Cultural
Requesting approval for: Mural

Statements: Ms. McCollum presented her plan to put a mural on the wall of the Legal Services building. She stated that she would be putting a painting of Rev. Shuttlesworth on the wall across from City Hall. Ms. McCollum stated that the painting would be 15' high and 10' wide. She also stated that the specific paints weren't picked out, but that she would be color matching the paints in the mock-up. Mauk asked if the wall was already painted. Ms. McCollum stated that it was.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Holloway

Discussion: none



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VI. Name: Mr. Justin Brown

Site Address: 1630 2nd Avenue South (The Fenec)

District: Midtown

Requesting approval for: Exterior renovations (streetscape and landscaping) (Last seen 5/26/21)

Statements: Mr. Brown presented his plan to add two new outdoor seating areas at The Fenec, between the bike lane and the sidewalk. He stated that he had been working with BDOT on the design. BDOT recommended a curbed landscape buffer between the bike lane and the on-street parking. Mr. Brown stated that the grassed area between the bike lane and the sidewalk would be mulched and planted. Wolfe asked why the applicant was requesting the changes. Mr. Brown stated that they wanted more outdoor dining space and that the grassed area is mostly dead, so they wanted to make the space look better. Wieseman asked if the applicant agreed with the comments from BDOT. Mr. Brown stated that they did.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal as presented.

Motion seconded by: Hoskins

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VII. Name: ~~Ross & Kelly Smith~~

Site Address: ~~619 34th Street South~~

District: ~~Avondale Park Local Historic District~~

Requesting approval for: ~~Install vinyl replacement windows~~

Statements: This item was removed from the agenda.

VIII. Name: Mr. David Brandt (Fravert Services, Inc.)

Site Address: 2207 2nd Avenue North

District: 2nd Avenue North

Requesting approval for: Signage (last seen 9/14/22)

Statements: Mr. Brandt stated that he had reduced the size of the proposed sign, to be more in line with the other signs along the street. Mr. Brandt stated that the proposed sign would be the exact size and positioning as the sign for the Canary Gallery next door. Mr. Brandt stated that the mesh fin would remain. He also stated that the sign



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
September 28, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

would not be lit. Wieseman stated that the bottom of the sign hung over the transom. Mr. Brandt stated that the sign could be raised, so that it's not in front of the window. He also stated that he could reduce the height of the sign a little bit, to make it fit the space better.

Motion: Wieseman made a motion to approve this proposal on two conditions: 1) that it doesn't exceed the dimensions shown on the plan, and 2) that the sign is shifted up on the building so that the bottom of the blade sign is above the transom window.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, Burnett made a motion to adjourn. Wolfe seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 7:55 a.m.