



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Applicants please note: The decisions of the Design Review Committee (the Committee) are binding. It is each applicant's responsibility to see that the decisions of the Committee are carried out as stipulated. Any changes or deviations from the Committee's decision, including but not limited to: colors, forms, configurations, materials, assemblies or any other aspects of the approved work shall not be undertaken by the applicant or the applicant's agent unless said changes are approved by the Committee beforehand. Under the terms of City ordinance, any change or deviation from work approved by the Committee constitutes a violation of the ordinance and renders the applicant subject to citation with penalties as prescribed by a city magistrate. In addition, please note that prior to obtaining any permit(s), all applicants must meet with Zoning staff to determine compliance with the Zoning regulations. Design Review approval does NOT mean that Zoning has approved the request.

Members Present: Ivan Holloway, Richard Mauk, Shelia Montgomery-Mills, Willie Oliver, Chris Swain, Brian Wolfe

Members Absent: Abra Barnes, Scott Burnett, Creig Hoskins, Ben Wieseman

Staff Present: Karla Calvert, Lauren Havard, John Sims

Others Present: Robert Emerick, John Forney, John Katalik, Will Mason, Trevor Matchett, Jimmy Shunnara

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Mauk. He stated that the minutes from the 9/28/22 meeting were ready. Wolfe made a motion to approve the minutes. Holloway seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- I. Name:** Mr. Jimmy Shunnara
Site Address: 1317 28th Street North
District: Norwood Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: New windows, new doors, replace some siding, new roof, paint

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Havard stated that the proposal was approved with conditions.

On October 5, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Norwood Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1317 28th St. N, and the Committee took the following action: Approve with Conditions.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve with Conditions the design review request for the following reasons:

Page 13-Item E-Doors

“Original doors, frames, hardware and glass shall be retained and maintained where possible since original doors help to define a house’s architectural style and therefore are of great importance to the preservation of a historic structure. Repair in accordance with the original design is preferred over replacement.

When repair of original doors, frames, hardware and glass is not possible due to extreme deterioration, replacements should match the original design or be consistent with the architectural style of the home.”

Page 15-Item K-Materials

“Alternative materials shall not be used unless such materials visually replicate the original exterior in appearance, dimensions, texture, etc. to every degree possible.”

“Repair or replacement of damaged siding with original siding material is encouraged when appropriate...”

See conditions below.

Page 16-Item L-Paint

“Previously unpainted stone shall never be painted.”

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary)

“Maintain the historic design and character of existing porch structures. Deteriorated frame porch elements shall be repaired where needed. If replacement is necessary, it shall be with matching wood pieces or other matching materials.”

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs

“In Norwood, roofing materials primarily include asphalt shingles, terra cotta clay tiles and concrete shingles.”

See conditions below.

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative)

“All historic trim shall be repaired and maintained. Any elements of the trim which become deteriorated shall be repaired or replaced with new pieces that match the original design and proportions.”

See conditions below.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Page 19-Item U-Windows

"The windows of a historic home are an important feature of the home's architecture. For that reason, every effort should be made to preserve and maintain original windows, including the original opening, window frame and sash.

Replacement of entire windows shall be discouraged. However, where window replacement is unavoidable because of deterioration, new frame units are to match the original window in terms of material, style, light pattern (design), construction and proportions."

See conditions below.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was based on the following sections of the local historic district's design guidelines:

Page 13-Item E-Doors

Page 15-Item K-Materials

Page 16-Item L-Paint

Page 17-Item N-Porches (primary)

Page 18-Item Q-Roofs

Page 19-Item T-Trim (decorative)

Page 19-Item U-Windows

The Local Historic Advisory Committee also voted to request that the following conditions be placed upon this request:

1. Any new siding must match the original siding.
2. Applicant stated new asphalt shingles in "weathered wood" color will be installed. This product was not submitted with the initial application, but committee approves this product.
3. Should any of the existing trim need to be repaired new trim shall match the original. Applicant stated that he intends to reinstall corner boards that were previously removed from the house. Corner boards should match the exposure of the original.
4. Applicant proposed a number of window changes, committee felt that the proposed changes would not be appropriate to the style and character of the house. After much discussion on site the committee recommends the following course of action for the windows:

Front: Two vinyl windows can be replaced with the proposed wood replacement windows to match the original size and light pattern of the historic windows. The other two existing original windows on the front should remain in place.

North Side (driveway side): At the time of the meeting all original windows were on site, either still hung in the original openings, or sashes had been removed, but remained



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

on site. All windows on this side except the second window from the front of the house should remain. The committee agreed that the small window could be removed to accommodate a new bathroom inside as long as all other original windows of the North facade remain in place.

Rear: Proposal shows removal of two small windows and installation of one new larger window. Committee understands that this solution is an attempt at trying to solve a water issue where the basement access meets the corner of the existing window. The preference of the committee is that the left window that has water damage can be removed, but the right window should remain in place as is.

South side: The five windows closest to the front corner of the house are prominent and original and should be kept in place and restored. The committee agreed that the applicant can alter the windows on the back half of the south facade. After discussion with the applicant it was agreed that instead of the single new window as shown in his proposal, the existing double window at the back corner of the house will be reused and centered in the new kitchen space remounted at the same height in the new location. The existing window from the North side of the house that is being removed to accommodate a bathroom will be reused in the new laundry room at the back corner of the south facade. Laundry window will be mounted at the same height as the double window in the kitchen.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Shunnara stated that he agreed to the changes/conditions that the LHAC made for the proposal. Mr. Shunnara stated that he was using Toque White as the main color on the body of the house and would use Urbane Bronze as the trim color. He stated that the shingles would be “weathered wood.” Mr. Shunnara presented his replacement siding,



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

which exactly matches the existing.

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this case, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Holloway

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- II. Name:** Ms. Sissy Austin (Architect)
Site Address: 3125 Argyle Road
District: Red Mountain Suburbs Local Historic District
Requesting approval for: New windows and doors; new landscaping, terraces, and pool; and exterior painting

Statements: This item was removed from the agenda.

- III. Name:** Mr. Will Mason
Site Address: 5503 1st Avenue North
District: Woodlawn
Requesting approval for: Façade improvements and signage

Statements: Mr. Mason presented his plan to update the façade of the Woodlawn Theatre. He stated that the theatre would have two uses. It will be used for music education and a music venue. Mr. Mason stated that he wanted to repair the EIFS and paint it a charcoal gray. He also stated that he would be replacing the storefront.

Mr. Mason stated that he would be adding a new “Woodlawn Theatre” sign. He also stated that he would be adding a static reader board with removeable letters. Mauk asked if the static reader board was allowed per the Guidelines. Sims said that it was okay as long as it wasn’t digital. Mauk asked what the reader board would be used for. Mr. Mason stated that it would be used to advertise events at the theatre.

Motion: Oliver made a motion to approve this proposal on the condition that the marquee is only used to advertise events at the theatre.

Motion seconded by: Wolfe

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

- IV. Name:** Mr. John Blocker
Site Address: 2121 8th Avenue North
District: Cultural
Requesting approval for: Metal canopy, steel rails, and concrete wall

Statements: Mr. Trevor Matchett presented his plan for parking garage updates for the 2121 building. He stated that the railing at the top of the parking garage was not tall enough and did not meet code. He stated that he would be adding an additional piece to the top of the railing so that it would comply. He stated that the additional piece was also used on the stair tower itself, so it would comply. Mr. Matchett stated that the additional piece would have a cap on it so that it would look finished. He stated that the parking garage was almost not visible from the street. He stated that a small canopy would be added between the parking garage and the building. He stated that the canopy would have an aluminum frame and would have a bronze anodized finish. Mr. Matchett also presented new lighting for the parking structure. He stated that the owner wanted the parking garage well-lit for safety.

Motion: Swain made a motion to approve this proposal.

Motion seconded by: Montgomery-Mills

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- V. Name:** Mr. Joe Demaras
Site Address: 1620 Reverend Abraham Woods Jr. Boulevard
District: Downtown Northwest
Requesting approval for: Renovation

Statements: Mr. Demaras presented his plan to add a fence around the condo building. He stated that the fence would be 8' tall and wooden on the front of the building, and black chain link on the other three sides. He stated that he would be removing some of the existing fence because it is rusted and falling over. Mr. Demaras stated that there was existing black chainlink fence that would remain. He also stated that he wanted to add new wooden stairs with iron hand rails. He also stated that he would be adding wooden decks to the rear of the building. He stated that the decks would be 6'x8'. Montgomery-Mills asked if the wood would be painted. Mr. Demaras stated that the wood would be clear coat stain. Sims verified that the existing black fence would be left alone. Montgomery-Mills stated that the wooden deck and stairs did not fit in with the aesthetic of the building. Wolfe stated that a railing detail was needed. Wolfe stated that more details were needed on each of the renovation pieces. The committee



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

requested a product spec sheet for the deck coating, and the committee requested that the applicant verify zoning compliance for the proposed fence.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to carry this case over pending more information.

Motion seconded by: Oliver

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

- VI. Name:** Mr. John Katalik (The Home Depot) and Mr. Tim Riley (The Neher Group)
Site Address: 3201 Argyle Road
District: Red Mountain Suburbs
Requesting approval for: Installing five Fibrex replacement windows

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved.

On 10/6/22, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Redmont Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 3201 Argyle Road, and the Committee took the following action: Approved with 4 Votes.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Katalik presented his case to install five windows on a home on Argyle Road. He stated that the new windows would match the existing configuration and light pattern. He stated that the windows were a close imitation of a wood window. Holloway asked if the windows were paintable. Mr. Katalik said yes. Wolfe verified that the trim would match the existing.

Motion: Wolfe made a motion to approve this proposal as presented, in agreement with



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Swain

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

VII. Name: Mr. John Forney (John Forney Architecture & Planning)

Site Address: 1132 Glen View Road

District: Forest Park Local Historic District

Requesting approval for: Installing new roofing (metal) on the south (side) and west (rear) roof faces, and installing solar panels on that new roof area (south and west faces)

Statements: Chairman Mauk asked if there was a report from the LHAC. Calvert stated that the proposal was approved.

On October 10, 2022, the Local Historic Advisory Committee (LHAC) for the Forest Park Local Historic District heard the DRC case for the property located at 1132 Glen View Road, and the Committee took the following action: Approve.

The recommendation of the Local Historic Advisory Committee was to Approve the design review request for the following reasons: Applicant's plan is in keeping with the architectural integrity of the neighborhood.

The LHAC also made the following findings:

1. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Conforms to the design standards established.
2. The proposed change, erection, or demolition: Is compatible with the character of the historic property and the historic district and does not detract from their historic value.
3. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any significant architectural feature of the resource.
4. The proposed erection, alteration, restoration, relocation, or demolition, in whole or in part: Will be compatible with the exterior features of other improvements within the District.

Mr. Forney presented his plan to install solar panels on the south facing side of the home. Mr. Forney stated that the existing roof was too fragile for the solar panel installation. He stated that the south facing portion of the roof would be converted to a standing seam metal roof. He stated that the existing roof cap would remain. Mr. Forney stated that the full thickness of the roof and the solar panels would be less than 6".



City of Birmingham Design Review Committee
Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2022

Meeting Time: 7:30 a.m.

Meeting Location: City Council Chambers, 3rd Floor, City Hall

Motion: Montgomery-Mills made a motion to approve this proposal, in agreement with the LHAC.

Motion seconded by: Swain

Discussion: none

Vote: The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, Montgomery-Mills made a motion to adjourn. Oliver seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 8:10 a.m.